

# Street-level Bureaucrats and Venezuelan Migration to Brazil: Governmentality, Agency, and State Transformation

*José O. Pérez, The Ohio State University<sup>1</sup>*

## **Abstract**

Over the past few years, Brazil has integrated over 425,000 Venezuelan migrants/refugees by resettling them to various municipalities, without any noticeable anti-immigrant backlash. Meanwhile, U.S. cities, like New York and Chicago, with considerably more resources and technology, have struggled to integrate about 119,000 Venezuelan and other migrants/refugees during recent years, and have experienced significant anti-immigrant backlash. This raises the question: how can states incorporate migrants/refugees into local communities and municipal public services, while avoiding social backlash? This article argues that street-level bureaucrats can play a key role in integrating migrants/refugees and reducing societal backlash, despite a lack of sophisticated software, detailed policy directives, or budgetary resources. I support these claims by employing recent Venezuelan migration to Brazil since 2017 as an in-depth case study of the contemporary relationship between migration influxes and local bureaucratic agents. Consequently, I contend that Brazilian street-level bureaucrats effectively integrate Venezuelan migrants/refugees by *learning new skills, creating informal networks of support, socializing migrants/refugees within local norms, and searching for new resources*. Research methods include an interpretative approach based on 290 semi-structured interviews and 60 participant observations with Brazilian bureaucrats and Venezuelan migrants/refugees, across multiple field sites. In effect, bureaucrats are not merely “cogs in the machine,” but rather they learn from quotidian interactions with migrants/refugees, in ways that are easily *overlooked* and difficult to *quantify*, especially in situations where they lack clear policy or legal directives on how to approach these populations.

**Key words:** street-level bureaucrats, bureaucracy, state-building, migration, integration, Brazil, Venezuela

---

<sup>1</sup> José O. Pérez is a Ph.D. candidate in Political Science at The Ohio State University. Email: perez.624@osu.edu  
ORCID: <https://orcid.org/0000-0002-9302-4591>

This research received funding from the: Fulbright-Hays Doctoral Dissertation Research Abroad (DDRA) Fellowship, Mershon Center for International Security Studies, Alumni Grants for Graduate Research and Scholarship (AGGRS) Program, Susan Pratt Munthe Graduate Scholarship for Study on Latin America, Global Gateway Grant, and the Department of Political Science at The Ohio State University. This project was reviewed and approved by the Institutional Review Board of The Ohio State University and deemed “Exempt with Limited IRB Review” under project #2023E0807.

*The New York Times* reports that Texas Governor Greg Abbott’s busing of 119,000 Venezuelan and other migrants and refugees (hereafter: migrant/refugee)<sup>2</sup> groups to Chicago, Los Angeles, New York, Philadelphia, and other cities over the past two years has completely shifted the United States’ (U.S.) immigration debate (Goodman et al. 2024). Moreover, they report these municipalities historically known for being “migrant friendly,” and with vast experience incorporating large numbers of migrants/refugees in short periods of time, are struggling to cope with this recent migratory influx, placing considerable strains on public healthcare, education, housing, and other services. This raises the question: are contemporary migrant/refugee influxes, that are sizeable and sudden, a burden on local bureaucracies and municipal public services? Furthermore, one could imagine that if these Global North metropolises with billion-dollar budgets, established public policies, and expansive professional staffs are struggling with migrant/refugee reception and integration, then the situation can only possibly be worse in settings where resources are more sparse and public policies run thinner in their implementation.

However, since 2017, Brazil has received over 425,000 Venezuelan migrants/refugees, most entering the country via the border state of Roraima, prompting Brazil to create *Operação Acolhida* (“Operation Welcome”) to assist these individuals and resettle them to host communities throughout the country (R4V 2024). Over 125,000 Venezuelans have been resettled across every Brazilian state and over 1,026 municipalities, ranging considerably in population size and economic productivity (R4V 2024). Moreover, this process has occurred without any noticeable anti-immigrant backlash or strain on municipal public services or bureaucratic capacities. This

---

<sup>2</sup> As Kelsey Norman discusses, a *refugee* is commonly understood as someone that has been recognized by the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR) or a host state as having been forced to flee their native country due to persecution or other reasons and has been granted protection under the 1951 UN Convention on the Status of the Refugee or other similar legal regime. An *asylum seeker* is someone who has applied to be recognized as a refugee, but still lacks the official determination. And *migrant* is a broader category that encapsulates both individuals that left their home country to seek better economic, or other social opportunities, and those who do not necessarily qualify for refugee status and instead seek legal permanent residency or other forms of legal incorporation (2021: 11-13).

generates the research puzzle addressed in this article: Why have Brazilian municipalities with infinitely fewer resources been able to incorporate 425,000 Venezuelan migrants/refugees over the past few years without causing a migratory “crisis,” while U.S. cities with considerably more resources have been unable to adequately incorporate 119,000 Venezuelan and other migrants/refugees during the same period?

This article argues that although migratory influxes can act as a shock to local bureaucratic organizations and public services – there is nothing *inherent* about them that leads to 1) a decay of public services, 2) an inability of public servants to adapt to the unique needs of migrants/refugees, or 3) a bureaucratic or social backlash against migrant/refugee populations. Instead, when bureaucrats who have the agency to decide *if* and *how* to incorporate these vulnerable populations, and subsequently when many of them willingly choose to go *above-and-beyond* their job duties, this can smooth out migrant/refugee incorporation into local communities and transform how the bureaucracy operates. Stated differently, I contend that local street-level bureaucrats with the *autonomy* to implement policy as they see fit, and who are *connected* to their local communities, can effectively work to integrate migrants/refugees despite a lack of sophisticated software, well detailed policy directives, or vast budgetary and other resources. To substantiate these claims, this article presents a detailed case study, stemming from qualitative and ethnographic fieldwork data of recent Venezuelan migration to Brazil.

The theoretical intervention of this article is to nuance and problematize conventional thinking vis-à-vis the relationship between bureaucracies and migratory shocks, by highlighting the oftentimes hidden or overlooked role of *individual street-level bureaucrats* (Lipsky 2010[1980]) in local integration efforts. Secondly, I contend this process also impacts state-building via the spillover effects that adapting to the needs of vulnerable migrant/refugee

populations has for how bureaucrats work and provide public services. Contra a Weberian (1978) understanding of bureaucracy as a faceless, rigid, and hierarchical entity that treats everyone in an equal and predictable manner, and contra a Foucauldian (1980, 2001) understanding of bureaucracy as an apparatus for advancing the state's grasp on and discipline over its subjects via governmentality – I showcase how Brazilian low-level bureaucrats that hold flexible power and agency choose *if* and *how* they incorporate Venezuelan migrants/refugees into local communities. Brazilian bureaucrats do this by granting them assistance (or not) when they seek out the state, and by engaging in a series of quotidian, habitual, and intimately close relations with Venezuelan migrant/refugee populations that transform the Brazilian state, as they assist these vulnerable populations. Consequently, I delineate how contact with Venezuelan migration impacts Brazil's bureaucratic capacities and state-building as it positions public servants to *learn new skills, create formal and informal networks of support, socialize migrants/refugees within Brazilian social and legal norms, and search for new resources*. In other words, Brazilian bureaucrats are not merely “cogs in the machine” of the state apparatus, but rather have personal views about *who* should have access to public services and *how*, transforming them into “agents of care,” positioned to creatively meet the unique needs of migrant/refugee populations. The following sections then illustrate that migration influxes impact public institutions and services as bureaucrats learn from their quotidian interactions with these populations, in ways that are easily *overlooked* and difficult to *quantify*.

Returning to “Operation Welcome,” it functions to receive Venezuelans at the border and resettle them to municipalities throughout Brazil. Upon arrival in local communities there are laws stating, and expectations from the federal government and Operation Welcome, that these Venezuelan individuals *should* be integrated into local societies and given access to public services. Yet, there is no federal migration policy or law, or even municipal laws oftentimes in

place to determine specifically *how* this process should occur. Likewise, there are multiple and daily decisions that Brazilian public servants must make as they encounter Venezuelan migrants/refugees and whose answers are not stated in written policy or law, such as: renewing residency paperwork yearly, accessing public health, or learning the local language and customs.

These Venezuelan migrants/refugees<sup>3</sup> have chosen Brazil because it borders their home country, making the process of reaching Brazil relatively easy, as most are fleeing economic, political, and social calamity. Venezuela has experienced extensive inflation over the past few years, and a decay of all public services, as well as an increasingly autocratic regime. Thus, these Venezuelans in Brazil are entering a new citizen-bureaucrat relationship, diametrically opposed to one they had previously been accustomed to at home. And, conversely, until recently Brazil<sup>4</sup> was primarily a migrant sending, and not a migrant receiving state, with currently about only 1% of its total population being comprised of migrants/refugees. Meaning, for many Brazilian bureaucrats it is the first time in their careers they are working with migrant/refugee populations. In fact, many municipalities in Brazil have recently created job openings and offices for bureaucrats to work specifically with migrants/refugees. This encounter between foreigners not habituated with a functioning bureaucracy, and bureaucrats not familiar with foreign public service users, provides a unique case study of what ensues when these two groups meet within a legal regime that states the latter have the power to choose if and how to help the former.

---

<sup>3</sup> Brazil has allowed Venezuelans into the country under two main legal categories, “permanent resident,” and “refugee.” However, both categories give legal access to all public services and employment in Brazil. For simplicity, I refer to them collectively as “migrants/refugees” throughout this article even though there are technical differences between the two categories.

<sup>4</sup> Brazil has also experienced migratory influxes from Cuba, Haiti, Senegal, Syria, and other states over recent decades, but none have been as significant as Venezuelan migration.

## **BUREAUCRACY, GOVERNMENTALITY, AND THE STATE IN LATIN AMERICA**

State-building, in the theoretical tradition of Max Weber, is the study of how the state constructs itself by enhancing its bureaucratic capabilities and reach. For Weber, state-building is the formation of a hierarchical, impersonal, and rule-oriented bureaucracy, that allows the state to approach everyone in an equal and predictable manner (Weber 1978). In opposition to this reasoning, Foucault sustained that modern European states since the 1600s have embarked on a gradual, but persistent process of *governmentality*, or state-led methods to manage, control, and direct the behavior of populations both directly and at a distance (1980, 1984, 2001). Governmentality is the “art of government,” meaning “...concerned are in fact men, but men in their relations, their links, their imbrication with those things that are wealth, resources, means of subsistence, the territory with its specific qualities...customs, habits, ways of acting and things...” (2001: 208-9).” For Foucault, bureaucrats are a key component of the modern state’s drive to instill governmentality as they become the faces, eyes, hands, feet – in short, the physical embodiment of the state – responsible for caring for populations (2003). Examples of the purview of state bureaucrats include demographic information, public safety, medicalization of the masses, and so forth (Foucault 1984, 2001). This article then is a thorough examination of how Venezuelan migrants/refugees are incorporated by Brazilian bureaucrats into local systems of governmentality, and in turn impact and alter these systems of caring for populations, due to their unique needs.

Michael Lipsky characterizes this governance phenomenon as *street-level bureaucrats* or, “Public service workers who interact directly with citizens in the course of their jobs, and who have substantial discretion in the execution of their work (2010[1980]: 3).” Street-level bureaucrats include social workers, teachers, police officers, and so forth, which hold considerable power over who is considered eligible for public assistance and how, meaning their role is not only to

implement policy but also to allocate resources (Lipsky 2010[1980]: 8, Zacka 2017). Street-level bureaucrats are often envisioned as low-level and poorly paid individuals that carry out the routinized functions of the state, but who in fact, "...mediate aspects of the constitutional relationship of citizens to the state. In short, they hold the keys to a dimension of citizenship (Lipsky 2010[1980]: 4)." However, this raises questions, examined in subsequent sections, of how do street-level bureaucrats mediate this relationship between migrants/refugees and the state? What extra work or different treatment is necessary when dealing with vulnerable migrant/refugee populations?

Bureaucrats are individuals who face daily moral dilemmas as they adjudicate on the cases and individuals before them and decide if and how to act, meaning bureaucratic life, "...is much more fluid, flexible, and open to contingency than one might expect when looking at such organizations from without (Zacka 2017: 4-5)." Zacka identifies three dispositions that street-level bureaucrats embrace as they approach the cases before them and make decisions to help or not: *indifferent*, *enforcer*, or *caregiver* bureaucrats, and they can employ *one or a mix* of these dispositions in a single case, afternoon, month, or even over their entire career (2017: chap. 2, 2022). Iza Ding, in turn, finds that in spaces where scrutiny of local bureaucracies is high, but resources and capacity are low, street-level bureaucrats engage in "performative" governance or the employment of reaffirming language, social symbols, and public gestures to make it *appear* they are delivering services (2020). Other scholars argue street-level bureaucrats are more likely to take ownership of policy changes and attempt to implement them, if they feel they have the discretionary power to implement policy in their own way (Tummers and Bekkers 2014). And Ho (2022) even finds evidence that "benevolent policies," aimed at people with low political power

(such as migrants/refugees), can come about as a result of local bureaucrats using international organizations to pressure executive leaders and government ministries in the Global South.

Stated differently, migrants/refugees do not vote and have limited claims on social citizenship – they could simply be ignored by local municipal bureaucrats. Yet, the fact that numerous local bureaucrats, such as those in Brazil discussed further below, decide to care and assist them gives credence to their power and ability to transform local states as they take on the oftentimes difficult work of migrant/refugee integration. Bureaucrats then can be understood as multifaceted and multidimensional actors with agency to decide when, where, and how to exercise power as they carry out what appears on the surface as repetitive, mundane, memorized labor (Potter 2019, Williamson 2018). For instance, U.S. immigration policy is not entirely domestic or laid out in written law, but rather becomes fully fleshed out and even internationalized to other states through the work of mid-level U.S. bureaucrats that seek both expertise, and to position themselves as experts, on migration control procedures (Bautista-Chavez 2020.) In analyzing drug enforcement policy in colonial Southeast Asia, Diana Kim presents how bureaucrats are not passive agents through which the state simply acts or is anthropomorphized, but rather are conscientious social beings that study and learn from the spaces where they are assigned to work, and incorporate that knowledge into their daily work as they choose *how* to enact policy prescriptions (2020). In essence, scholars are beginning to open the “black box” of state bureaucracies to explore how following formal legal codes *or* more flexible approaches to solving policy challenges emerges and takes precedence in a society (Mangla 2022, Potter 2019), thereby making bureaucracies more personable and less rigid.

Bourdieu approached institutions from the perspective that despite their apparent rigidity and lack of flexibility, they are, upon closer inspection, deeply susceptible to human creativity for



rule-bending and innovation (1984, 1986). Institutions also exist within a sea of ever-changing domestic and internationalized cultural and political norms that are not easily detected or always written down, and produce various forms of economic, social, and cultural capital that influences individuals' agency (Basaran and Olssen 2018). In conversation with Bourdieu, Yoshiko Herrera demonstrates how in post-Soviet Russia seemingly mechanical and powerless low-level state administrators were able to drastically reorganize the state's bureaucratic system and shift norms in the midst of an economic crises (2010). Put differently, my argument here is that an army of ant-like bureaucrats has the power to be not only a rule and norm "taker," but also a rule and norm "maker" (Herrera 2010), and consequently the implementation of policy is not just top-down, but also simultaneously bottom-up. This is what Rodrigo Nunes (2021) terms settings where political organization is neither truly or completely "vertical nor horizontal."

Moreover, bureaucratic institutions in Latin America have even been shown to act as "veto players" within the political arena that leverage the services they provide to coerce elected officials into slowing down or abandoning institutional reform efforts (González 2017, 2019). Latin American bureaucrats have also been found to employ "forbearance," or the selective imposition of taxes on lower-income individuals, as a method for informal resource redistribution that reduces social tension (Holland 2017, 2018). Thus, street-level bureaucrats are, overall, powerful agents with the discretion not only to make and implement policy, but also to decide *how* policy is implemented daily, on the ground, and in cases not fully covered by the written word of the law, a process that holds true as well for Latin America societies. Street-level bureaucrats also create and impose norms and rules as they carry out their daily tasks in ways that impact both the native-born and foreign populations they come into contact with in their offices, agencies, and service centers.

## **Migration, Bureaucracy, and the State**

With respect to migration and its impact on state bureaucracies specifically, Kelsey Norman (2021) argues Global South states have three options when responding to migration and refugee influxes: a liberal response of inclusion, a repressive response of exclusion, or one of strategic indifference (see Freier, Micinski, and Tsourapas 2021). A *liberal response* is when a state, like Brazil's case here with Venezuelan migration, allows migrants/refugees full access to public services and attempts to incorporate them into local societies by spending resources on them. A *repressive approach* means migrants/refugees are excluded out-right from public services through laws or policing. The third approach of *strategic indifference* is when Global South states tactically choose to expend fewer state resources helping migrants/refugees than they could, leaving NGOs and international donors to pick up the bill for their services, while avoiding the international criticism that a repressive approach can spark. Global South states – and their bureaucrats – then have agency in deciding how and when to integrate migrants/refugees into local public services and societies, but choosing the liberal response of inclusion does not preclude other issues and nuances from arising for these vulnerable populations and the bureaucrats tasked with assisting them.

Furthermore, some scholars have found evidence for the possibly negative consequences that migration poses for local bureaucracies. For instance, Zhou finds via fieldwork in refugee camps in Tanzania that a refugee influx, “substantially increases national identification, resource resentment, and participation in public goods,” amongst natives in Tanzania (2023, see also Holland, Peters and Zhou 2023). Following a similar logic, Salehyan and Gleditsch contend refugee influxes can destabilize receiving states and lead to incidents of political violence and the spillover of conflicts across borders (2006, see also Adida 2014, Idler 2020). Furthermore,

resettling refugees is an oftentimes difficult, but only *initial*, step towards addressing their needs and mitigating the negative externalities their resettlement can pose for political stability in host states (McMurdo 2016). For instance, Zhou and Lyall find no evidence of decreased prejudice towards internally displaced persons (IDPs) in Afghanistan even after eight months of close contact between locals and IDPs (2023). According to Gaikwad and Nellis, even rural-to-urban migrants face difficulty in accessing public services and integrating into urban areas because politicians know they are less likely to vote and ignore their interests (2017, 2021). Rafaela Dancygier (2010) coins the term “immigrant-state conflict” to encompass the struggles that can ensue between immigrant-origin communities and local state actors, such as the police, in contexts of economic scarcity.

Contra these findings, other scholars argue migrant/refugee influxes can produce positive impacts for host countries. Auerbach et al. (2019) find internal migration across the Global South can create unique opportunities for political participation, collective action, and making claims on the state for public service provisions. Others find that an increase in immigration can lead to maintenance or even increases in social welfare spending, public good provisions, and does not impact welfare generosity (Charnysh 2019, Fenwick 2019, Rueda and Stegmüller 2016). And more recently, Zhou, Grossman, and Ge (2023) find that liberal migrant/refugee hosting policies can lead to numerous positive spillover effects, “such as improved public school access, greater access to health clinics, more health utilization, and more road density.”

The scholarly literature is also ripe with examples of how migrants/refugees then respond to, or are impacted by, government integration policies, or a lack thereof (Fouka 2019, McNamee and Zhang 2019). Irene Bloemraad (2006), for instance, argues grassroots public institutions and seemingly superfluous efforts to integrate migrants into local communities, such as free language

classes, can have huge downstream consequences for their degree of incorporation and even naturalization rates. Mathilde Emeriau (2023) finds evidence that European officials tasked with deciding asylum applications “learn on the job” and discriminate considerably *less* against Muslim applicants after a year of service, hinting at bureaucrats acquiring new skills on the job. In summary, the empirical record is primarily *quantitative* and *mixed* with regards to migrants/refugees as either having “positive” or “negative” implications for politics and bureaucratic institutions in the countries they migrate to as they seek safety. However, Abigail Williamson argues that local municipal bureaucrats are key to understanding how immigrants are incorporated into small, oftentimes rural, and even conservative towns (such as many of the Brazilian small towns discussed below) in the absence of federal or state written policy or law as they engage in “municipal accommodation” (2018). This “accommodation” provides services to migrants/refugees above and beyond federal mandates, but Williamson posits, “...municipal responses to immigrants depend on how local officials perceive immigrants, whether as clients or outsiders, contributors or dependents, a protected class or ‘illegal aliens’ (2018: 5).” My contribution here is to illustrate via *qualitative* data an *overall positive* case study of how Brazilian local officials engage in practices that facilitate Venezuelan migrant/refugee integration into local communities and transform these individuals’ lives – but which *also* transform how Brazilian local officials carry out their work and the overall functioning of the Brazilian state.

## **RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODS<sup>5</sup>**

---

<sup>5</sup> For further details and information please see the methodological appendix.

The findings presented below are the outcome of twelve months of fieldwork in Brazil, conducted over two trips during 2022 and 2023.<sup>6</sup> The fieldwork sites were the metropolitan areas of: Porto Alegre, Brasilia, Boa Vista, Manaus, and São Paulo, as well as a “Miscellaneous” field site of online interviews with relevant individuals from across the country.<sup>7</sup> Each of these metropolitan field sites included multiple neighboring, smaller, more rural municipalities as well. These various and nested field sites collectively allow me to leverage variance in location to ascertain the overall relationship between migration and bureaucracy in Brazil as they span: the national border and heartland; metropolis, provincial capital, and small towns; the digital and physical realms; the urban and the rural; and the Amazon rainforest and concrete jungle of São Paulo industrialization.

In total, I gathered 290 in-person and virtual *anonymous semi-structured interviews* (150 with Brazilians of interest and 140 with Venezuelan migrants/refugees), as well as 60 *participant observations*. The Brazilian interviewee pool included: public servants, politicians, military officers, civil society members, immigration lawyers, and other community members. Both interview pools are diverse in terms of gender, age, race, political orientation, sexual identity, etc. and were recruited through personal contacts, snowball sampling, and random sampling techniques, such as calling social welfare offices in neighboring towns, or working with local NGOs to recruit participants. Participant observations included visiting municipal public services buildings, public health clinics, public squares and markets, and other spaces where migrants/refugees interact with locals and, in particular, bureaucrats.

---

<sup>6</sup> This research design proceeds from *data collection* to *iteration*, or “the updating of elements of research design as information acquired in the field is analyzed (Kapiszewski, MacLean, and Read 2015: 18),” in a process that is inductive and aims for an expanded causal story through detailed data.

<sup>7</sup> This is similar to the structure employed by numerous other scholars of multiple field site areas of interest approached with repeated interactions and constant interviewing to understand processes that are not readily documented or accessible otherwise, allowing the researcher to better grasp concepts and map out key actors (see Fenno 1978; Scott 1987; Stokes 1995; Wood 2003, 2009).

This research approach is centered on a case study design (see Van Evera 1997) that aimed to inductively build theory through ethnographic interactions (see Eriksen Rio 2024, Geertz 1973, Schatz 2009, Vrsti 2008, Wedeen 1999) with as many individuals, both Brazilian and Venezuelan, and institutions as possible. Due to my focus on bureaucrats, semi-structured interviews and an ethnographic approach were ideal for my objectives because they allowed me to look for political elements that are not easily quantifiable. This approach also allowed respondents to share the theories they employ to interpret their quotidian work and interactions with migrants/refugees, permitting me to constantly refine my theory in dialogue with my interviewees (Leech 2002, Mosley 2013). Or as Stephanie Schwartz explains: “[S]emi-structured interviews, repeat interactions, and metadata allow researchers to identify and apprehend why certain political behavior makes sense when considered in context (2019: 118, Fujii 2010).”

This research approach is what Foucault conceptualized as an “ascending analysis of power,” which examines social relations:

...starting, that is, from its infinitesimal mechanisms, which each have their own history, their own trajectory, their own techniques and tactics, and then see how these mechanisms of power have been – and continue to be – invested, colonized, utilized, involuted, transformed, displaced, extended etc. (1980: 99).

Sociologists have defined this qualitative research design strategy as “grounded theory,” or theory that is developed in the field, through action, stemming from empirical observations in real world settings, and which seeks to make sense of politics at the micro-level (Oktay 2012). What follows, then, is a presentation of the points that were repeated across numerous interviews and were agreed upon by multiple individuals, unless otherwise noted, while attempting to group varying experiences into thematic areas of bureaucratic transformation induced by migratory influxes.

## THE AGENCY AND POWER OF BUREAUCRATS IN BRAZIL

The social workers' unit that helps migrants/refugees is housed inside of a large brutalist, concrete structure that once acted as a two-story house for a middle-class family. They share this building with numerous other public services: child protective services, pension assistance, and food assistance programs. The downstairs area where migrants/refugees have their cases heard is decorated with flags, representing the different nationalities that currently live in this small, hilly, post-industrial town. Upstairs, to the right, at the end of the corridor is a small bare office – a calendar, two desks, and two computers – where the town's two social workers help all the town's migrants/refugees, as well as other townspeople, look for employment, write resumes, and so much more. There is a line of about 6 people – men and women, young and old – waiting to see the social workers. I used the downstairs bathroom as I waited to interview the social workers. The walls are covered in brown tiles from the 1980s, half of which have fallen from decay. The toilet does not quite flush no matter how hard I pressed the button on the wall.<sup>8</sup>

This brief recollection of a visit to a social welfare office in a small town near Porto Alegre, Brazil, which currently hosts about a 100 Venezuelan migrants/refugees presents the stark on-the-ground realities of local Brazilian bureaucrats that are currently working to help integrate these vulnerable populations. As part of my fieldwork, I visited dozens of similar offices across Brazil and noticed the same dynamics: sparse resources, dilapidated buildings, lines of people needing help, and a few public servants (usually women) working under these strained conditions. However, as Noah Nathan points out, and my participant observation above illustrates, “Simply counting a state’s physical footprint – its offices, infrastructure, and bureaucrats – does not provide a strong measure of its potential impact (2023: 6),” as bureaucrats may carry out labor or hold influence that is difficult to *observe* or *quantify* in macroeconomic indicators or survey measures. Nevertheless, these individuals work diligently within a setting of constrained resources to solve new and daily issues for Venezuelan migrant/refugee populations.

For example, Eliane, a social worker in the Porto Alegre metropolitan area, gave the following testimony:

I view my job, as well as I can do it, as guaranteeing these individuals’ rights. But this is not foreseen or written down anywhere, so if no one takes care of it, it won’t happen. There are many public servants who end up clinging onto the idea of doing only what is officially expected or foreseen in written policies. But nobody, as a public servant, if they want to do a good job, will do only what is officially expected of them, because it is impossible to predict all the things that will come up. And demands change over time, so for

---

<sup>8</sup> Participant Observation 11, May 2023

example [migrants' needs] are a phenomenon that didn't exist ten years ago. I believe that what is within the reach of our know-how, within legal bounds, and we can do to help citizens in this process is something that we should be doing, but this is a problem because it is very personal, that is, in another social services center they might not do this or that, because there really is no written prescription for how one should do everything...– Eliane<sup>9</sup>

As Eliane points out migrants/refugees, and their unique needs, are an issue that did not exist for low-level Brazilian bureaucrats a decade ago because their towns had few or no migrants/refugees. However, recent Venezuelan migration has led to these vulnerabilities appearing on their radar and a need for new “tactics” and responses from these public servants. Or as Foucault argued, “...the finality of government resides in the things it manages and in the pursuit of the perfection and intensification of the processes it directs; and the instruments of government, instead of being laws, now come to be a range of multiform tactics (2001: 211, see also Ettliger 2011),” meaning the modern “tactics” or approaches that bureaucrats employ with public service users has a huge impact on these individuals' lives and on how they view the state, and they can oftentimes become more important than what appears in written laws or public policies. Furthermore, I would highlight Eliane's insight that, “... it is very personal,” which denotes how *each individual* Brazilian local bureaucrat has the agency to engage (or not) with migrants/refugees in a personalistic manner (or lack thereof) with the potential to challenge our customary understanding of modern bureaucracies as detached and distant embodiments of the state.

Many of bureaucrats, like Eliane, that I spoke with also expressed exposure to and influence from Brazil's and Latin America's history of feminist organization and resistance that informs how they approach their quotidian work (Alvarez 1990). Several bureaucrats I interviewed also hold degrees in social work, public policy, pedagogy, political science, or IR and are trained in the tradition of Brazilian pedagogue Paulo Freire (2023[1968]) and other critical thinkers, meaning they view their work as street-level bureaucrats as an exercise in helping empower and

---

<sup>9</sup> Brazilian Interview 35, June 2023



liberate socially marginalized individuals. Furthermore, most of these public servants have this employment not through political appointment, but through public contests (“*concurso público*”) or civil service entrance exams in Brazil that test knowledge of Freire, and more-humanistic or feminist-oriented sociological ideologies, as well as other technical areas of public policy expertise. Public contests also confer upon these individuals a degree of job security, which fosters the space for bureaucrats to go above-and-beyond and take on issues not prescribed in their handbooks, since they know those issues will still be theirs in the future.

However, the lack of comprehensive pre-given directives or structures that Eliane also alludes to leads to disparate ways in how individual migrants/refugees experience governmentality and the assistance of the Brazilian state as they are incorporated into local societies. Or as Petra, another public servant in the Porto Alegre metropolitan area, explained:

I went to Roraima, along with other leaders who were invited by the president to host refugees in their towns, and I joke you not, we were taken into a room and they had all the Venezuelans there, and people started picking out the ones they wanted to take back to their towns. And while I was there, someone from the federal government came and took me aside and asked, “Look, do you mind if we send a few LGBT people in your group?” And I’m like, “Do I do mind?” And he said, “Yes, do you mind?” And I replied kind of harshly, “Of course I don’t mind. Do I look like a homophobe to you? Give me more than a few!” You know, it was something kind of like *Schindler’s List*, go into this room and pick the Venezuelans you are willing to have resettled in your city...People would arrive here [at my office] with my picture looking for me, like a saint or a religious deity. It was crazy. They would say another Venezuelan they knew had told them about me, and they had walked here from another town, and they would arrive here holding a picture of me cut out from the newspaper, saying they wanted to speak with me because I am the lady who helps Venezuelans. – Petra<sup>10</sup>

A difference in treatment drove certain Venezuelans to physically walk from another municipality to Petra’s to receive public assistance, because her municipality became known for helping migrants/refugees “more.” This municipal bureaucratic forum shopping by migrants/refugees would not be necessary if public services and experiences were more homogenized following a Weberian understanding of bureaucracies. Yet, this example once again betrays the power and agency of these seemingly low-level agents as they make choices that vastly impact these

---

<sup>10</sup> Brazilian Interview 16, April 2023

vulnerable populations' housing, employment, and future, as Petra's unsettling reference to the Holocaust film *Shindler's List* showcases. Put differently, the role of these municipal street-level bureaucrats is extremely important because migrants/refugees interact directly with the federal government almost exclusively when they enter Brazil and obtain official paperwork that allows them to live and work, and as they renew said immigration paperwork yearly. However, as numerous bureaucrats pointed out to me during interviews, migrants'/refugees' day-to-day interactions with the Brazilian state are mostly with municipal and state street-level bureaucrats that are responsible for public education, housing, healthcare, and so forth.

Despite differences in levels of engagement with Venezuelan migrant/refugee populations and their needs, Brazilian bureaucrats do share commonalities that I observed during my fieldwork. Specifically, they tend to view themselves as carrying out the official work of the state, and therefore act in accordance with an "occupational or professional ideology," that can, "serve as a way of disciplining goal orientations (Lipsky 2010[1980]: 147)," thereby establishing practices for how they carry out their daily tasks. As the participant observation, and the interviews with Eliane and Petra showcase, migrant/refugee integration is a relatively new policy area within many Brazilian communities that local bureaucrats have had to learn to respond to often in real time and without clear directives. Some bureaucrats have responded by doing the bare minimum that is federally and legally expected of them, while others like Eliane and Petra have taken on the extra labor that migrant/refugee integration requires in order to properly assist vulnerable Venezuelan populations. The "wobble room," so to speak, that Brazilian local public servants possess within their job duties has allowed many of them to integrate these individuals, while altering the *modus operandi* of their bureaucratic institutions through skills acquisition, networks of support,

socializing of migrants/refugees, and the procurement of new resources, as detailed in the sections below.

### **Learning New Skills and Enhancing Pre-existing Skills**

Meeting the needs of Venezuelan migrants/refugees compels Brazilian public servants to acquire new skills or sharpen pre-existing ones such as: managing new bureaucratic and paperwork processes pertaining to immigration documents, language skills, and interpersonal communication skills across cultural boundaries. This process of bureaucratic learning helps create and improve service delivery for migrants/refugees, as Sasha, a municipal public servant in the metropolitan area of Porto Alegre, recounted to me:

I work here at this immigrant information center, we are a part of the city's efforts for racial and ethnic equality services. Our work here is, basically, migration paperwork and documents. We provide assistance with immigration documents, where we leave all the paperwork ready for the people we assist, and we also schedule their immigration appointments with the Federal Police. Today, we have reserved time slots for our cases at the Federal Police, so nowadays it has become easier than before...And although we are a municipal service today, we provide this service for neighboring municipalities as well. We have been working on this issue of decentralization of services, because to give you an idea: before, it took approximately seven months to schedule an appointment with the Federal Police. Today, this period of time has been reduced considerably...So, we serve here 57 municipalities. – Sasha<sup>11</sup>

From Sasha's explanation of her daily work, we see how migration influxes have positioned municipal public servants to learn about federal immigration procedures, considering that is a service commonly sought out by the migrants/refugees residing in her community. This municipal shift, in turn, has had a positive impact on a federal agency, the Federal Police,<sup>12</sup> which was previously overburdened by migrants/refugees wanting to renew their residency permits, but having difficulty making the online appointment, and arriving to the appointment without all the necessary bureaucratic paperwork, leading to a rejection of their application and wasted time and

---

<sup>11</sup> Brazilian Interview 27, May 2023

<sup>12</sup> The Brazilian Federal Police (*Polícia Federal*) handles Brazil's border control efforts, and is tasked with issuing immigration paperwork for all foreigners living within Brazil, among other federal legal responsibilities.

resources. Through coordination between these municipal and federal agents, and acquisition of new skills by the municipal agents, a problem has been minimized, without drafting official policies, memos, or legislation. This is but one example of numerous like it I observed during my fieldwork. Sasha goes on to add:

The biggest challenge in serving immigrants is the language barrier, although today, my ear has gotten used to it. I've been working here since August 2021, so I understand them now. Although they speak Spanish, those who arrive are now arriving speaking *Portunhol* [mix of Spanish and Portuguese]. I am able to understand them and I am able to communicate with them...I ended up learning some words and I can speak *Portunhol* too so we can communicate in an adequate and correct way. – Sasha<sup>13</sup>

Thus, this street-level bureaucrat also had to learn language skills to communicate and carry out her tasks effectively. From Sasha's testimonial and other fieldwork overall, it seemed many Brazilian street-level bureaucrats view learning some Spanish, or key words from other languages, neither as a burden nor do they draw upon xenophobic tropes of, "they should be learning our language if they are living here," displayed by many Global North bureaucrats as an excuse to not assist migrant/refugee communities in their native languages. Instead, many Brazilian bureaucrats view learning key phrases in other language and foreign cultural practices as a necessary component for facilitating interactions between the state and migrant/refugee populations, and, consequently, as a part of their job.

However, these cross-cultural interactions are not always wrinkle-free as detailed by Stella, a public servant in Manaus that worked with Indigenous Warao Venezuelans specifically.

JP: What were the specific challenges the municipal government faced in responding to Indigenous Venezuelan migrants?

Stella: Understanding the language, the lack of knowledge of their language, the lack of technical capacity of the city's technical staff, of understanding how to work with Indigenous people...And cultural difference also, I am of the opinion that it is not through housing Indigenous people in public shelters that you will deliver better care for them, Indigenous people are a free people, they have customs, a culture, totally different habits, and when you place a large group in a shelter, you will have difficulty coordinating this group...Another issue is that we don't have a...I don't know if the word for it is "policy," but I'm going to use that term, an alcohol and anti-drugs policy, specifically, to work with the Indigenous Venezuelan population, and we had a great difficulty in working with Indigenous Venezuelan people, due to excessive consumption of alcohol and drugs, and this led to numerous conflicts within the shelters. Parallel to this, the

---

<sup>13</sup> Brazilian Interview 27, May 2023

city... only placed Indigenous people in these shelters, and they did not have a team to work in these spaces, and then the city demanded that Indigenous people comply with rules that were not worked on with them...In 2020, we started to have a technical team there, we started to be able to listen to the community, to understand their demands, to stop imposing, and instead to work collectively to build strategies. – Stella<sup>14</sup>

From Stella's interview we can gauge how her language challenge was even greater than Sasha's as Indigenous Warao Venezuelans oftentimes speak little or no Spanish, adding an extra layer of difficulty when it comes to communication. Furthermore, the relationship described here between city hall and Venezuelan Indigenous migrants/refugees, placed in a municipal shelter, is not conflict-free as both sides tried to exert their power over the other, and these Indigenous peoples resisted the city's governmentality strategies via "rules" they viewed as incompatible with their lifestyle and agency. However, this example also showcases how continual bureaucratic learning improved communication and cooperation within the shelter overtime, as actors learned from each other and interacted habitually, thereby creating trust and increasing the power of these agents.

### **Creating Formal and Informal Networks of Support**

The unique needs of Venezuelan migrants/refugees also propel Brazilian street-level bureaucrats to build new physical and digital infrastructures to meet the demands these populations place on the state. This process includes the creation of formal and informal networks of support among bureaucrats to jointly troubleshoot issues using their collective expertise, resources, and contacts. WhatsApp groups, Facebook forums, Instagram posts, and other social media tools are used to connect bureaucrats across different municipalities, states, and government agencies – as well as connect bureaucrats to migrant/refugee populations themselves. As Heloisa, a public servant in the metropolitan area of Porto Alegre, explained:

In addition to the dedicated physical office that we organized to serve our migrant population specifically, we have a broadcast list, which we use via WhatsApp, where we place all the information we find relevant, such as job vacancies, city celebrations...For example, today we received an invitation from a church that is

---

<sup>14</sup> Brazilian Interview 99, September 2023

going to hold a religious celebration in Spanish...we share when it is a holiday, and explain why it is a holiday in Brazil. It might seem trivial, but we manage to reach with each message about 250 people on WhatsApp. And we have two of these lists already created... – Heloisa<sup>15</sup>

And Filomena, a public servant in the state of Amazonas, detailed:

Currently, we work a lot together with the [UN] agencies. This didn't happen overnight, because, for us to establish this network and workflow, several meetings are necessary, and, recently, I was in a small town in the Amazon and I said: "Folks, for you to establish a network flow, it takes several meetings. And even after the flow has already been established, you have to maintain these meetings, because a new demand always arises, a new, unknown case that we don't know where to send to always arises." Often there are situations on the "hot network," [*rede quente*]... This is a slang term used by social workers here in Amazonas state, it is not an established network, but it works rather as an informal "hot" network, which we use when we get something out of nowhere, and then we sit down to study the case, with healthcare personnel and other agencies. And then we troubleshoot: "No, in this case, we did it this way..." – Filomena<sup>16</sup>

From Heloisa's experience we can see the unofficial labor conducted by this public servant who attempts to connect Venezuelan migrants/refugees in her municipality with local opportunities, as well as educate them about local events and holidays to reduce their social exclusion. In effect, she is creating an informal network, or community, among the several hundred Venezuelan migrants/refugees that have been resettled to her community, to help integrate them socially. To do so, Heloisa relies on WhatsApp, which is not a state-sanctioned platform, but rather a customary private messaging app used widely across the Global South, since it requires little internet to work and allows for data privacy due to its encryption methods. Filomena's labor also relies extensively on WhatsApp to coordinate informally with other local and international bureaucrats across the expansive state of Amazonas to solve dilemmas that are not in the manual, trade best practices, and find solutions to pressing issues related to the migrant/refugee community.

As part of my fieldwork, I participated in these informal WhatsApp groups and witnessed their importance – whether it be groups specifically for different migrant/refugee communities, immigration lawyers, public servants, or a mixture of these actors – for constantly sharing information and solving problems. For instance, it is typically to see in these WhatsApp groups

---

<sup>15</sup> Brazilian Interview 13, April 2023

<sup>16</sup> Brazilian Interview 98, August 2023

messages such as, “I have a family here in Santa Catarina of 5 Venezuelans (2 adults and 3 kids) none of them have a birth certificate and we are having difficulty getting their documents at the Federal Police, has anyone encountered this before?” And people then responding, “We had a similar case here and we...” Although seemingly trivial on the surface, as Heloisa states, WhatsApp, social media, and digital platforms are crucial for the work these individuals do of organizing themselves to deliver services and solve problems that are not addressed in legal codes or pre-existing policies. Likewise, these apps are important for divulging events, such as holidays and public festivals as Heloisa likewise points out, but also immigrants’ rights marches, vaccination drives, and public policy meetings.

Public servants also organize themselves informally and formally by establishing forums, committees, and working groups to debate and develop policies for migrants/refugees as Alice, a municipal public servant in the state of Minas Gerais, recounted:

In April 2021, through a decree, the municipality created the inter-sectoral committee on immigrant policy with the specific objective of creating a municipal policy for the immigrant population...So, from then on, we were able to start moving the structure of the municipality to think about the logic of immigrant policy within departments as a whole...In this committee, we had the Secretariats of: Economic Development, Social Assistance, Health, and Human Rights. And I said this to everyone...that the goal was for every immigrant to have work, healthcare, welfare assistance, economic development, which were the demands coming from the community at the time. The other demand was that we make a survey, an initial diagnosis of the problems...And in public health too, as we have highlighted the importance of specific policies for immigrants, our public health teams have then had these discussions...In terms of language, too, which is a barrier that we have, Spanish is close to Portuguese, but there are also cognates that are not so understandable, [Brazilians] also speak very quickly...So, to overcome this linguistic barrier, this year we are in the implementation phase of “cultural mediators.” – Alice<sup>17</sup>

As Alice explains, through the creation of meetings, committees, and forums, ideas and needs are placed on the public policy agenda and then gradually institutionalized by numerous segments of the bureaucratic apparatus. Public servants at the grassroots level rely on informal data gathering processes: meetings with vulnerable communities to hear their needs, informal surveys and questionnaires, and reflections on commonly recurring cases, to then draft policy

---

<sup>17</sup> Brazilian Interview 140, April 2023

changes and their implementation. For instance, Alice mentions “cultural mediators,” which is a growing policy change across Brazil, in response to increased migration over the past decade that consists of hiring native Spanish, Haitian creole, English, and/or Arabic speakers to act as translators in local public health clinics. Their role, as the name suggests, is not only to translate, but also to mediate across cultural differences between migrant/refugee populations and Brazilian public healthcare providers to ensure the patient’s cultural practices are respected. The idea and need for cultural mediators arose from these informal networks of exchange between public servants and migrants/refugees, which have gradually advocated for this change and turned it into concrete policy. A similar approach was also recounted by Lilizete, a public servant in Rio de Janeiro state.

We have a specific technical committee for migrant healthcare...Now, on the issue of education, we are now trying to create flows, we are managing to carry out many high school diploma revalidations through the Secretariat of Education...but in practice we still face some problems. For example, there is a school that serves the population of a local *favela*...that has a large concentration of Venezuelans and...Venezuelan children are being bullied at this school because they eat too much and try to save some food to take to their families. Bullying, due to food insecurity, is happening among these children, so we are trying to work on this issue...We have now started a survey through the municipal governments to try to locate where these migrants are, what their nationalities are, their gender and racial identity...But we still face a lot of xenophobia, a lot of lack of knowledge, including from professionals who think they cannot include this population in certain public services, so we have been working on this duality of going into local communities to understand the population, understand their demands, but also train the professionals [*profissionais de ponta*] that work with these populations on the ground. – Lilizete<sup>18</sup>

Even though there are laws against bullying and xenophobia in Brazil, there is no specific prescription in Lilizete’s job description as a public servant stipulating she *must* respond to these issues or *how*. Instead, the response stems from her awareness of these issues since she is a street-level bureaucrat that interacts closely with these populations and is willing to take on these issues, and solutions are subsequently crafted via dialogue with migrant/refugee communities and her colleagues. These informal and formal networks also allow bureaucrats to educate other bureaucrats on best practices, on legal norms they may be unfamiliar with, and fill lacunae in their

---

<sup>18</sup> Brazilian Interview 143, April 2023



knowledge of these populations, considering that for many it is the first time in their careers they are assisting migrant/refugee populations.

### **Socializing Migrants/Refugees within Social and Legal Norms**

Asides from educating their fellow bureaucrats, public servants are also positioned to educate migrants/refugees about Brazilian laws and ways of approaching the bureaucracy, and local social norms and customs. Brazil is a deeply legalistic and bureaucratic society, with complex and dense legal codes that regiment how daily life is administered, coupled with numerous unwritten codes and standards for how quotidian activities are to be handled. Bureaucrats then are unofficially tasked with relaying pieces of information that might seem “natural” or “obvious” to people who grew up within Brazil’s social milieu, but which are completely new and unknown to migrants/refugees. Specifically, Venezuelan migrants/refugees are coming from a socialist society and economy where individuals did not directly pay taxes, rent, or utilities, all services they must now pay in Brazil. Secondly, the employee-employer and citizen-state relationship in Venezuela, currently a socialist and semi-authoritarian regime, is different than the relationships these individuals are now positioned to perform in Brazil. Public servants gradually work to (re)educate these individuals with regards to these relationships to smooth out their social integration. Returning to Heloisa, she describes the early months of hosting Venezuelan migrants/refugees in her municipality and helping them integrate by stating:

During the day we dealt with question about resumes, at night we went to the shelters to talk to them, and I, as a pedagogue, also did some strengthening of local knowledge, because in the first days we had difficulty adapting to schedules for families who arrived with children or teenagers and our municipal school schedules...so here it was necessary to put in place a routine, waking up early, going to bed early, children going to sleep early, the mothers needing to be concerned about taking their children to school. So I was doing psycho-pedagogy workshops with them, also about socio-economic insertion...For the men...we held workshops inside the shelters, preparing them. For example, we knew these men were here, but they had families and eventually they would be bringing these families to Brazil, so we started talking about the Maria

da Penha law, protection of women in Brazil, women's rights in Brazil, and culturally problematic statements we witnessed through their quotidian conversations. – Heloisa<sup>19</sup>

From this excerpt we can see how the different structure of Venezuelan society necessitates that these local municipal bureaucrats socialize migrants/refugees into norms relating to capitalism, neoliberalism, worker's rights, domestic violence, and so forth. For Venezuelan migrants/refugees, many seemingly customary affairs are first time experiences, positioning Brazilian bureaucrats to teach them: how to read their paystubs when they first find jobs, about taxes that are discounted from their gross pay and why, how to rent an apartment in Brazil, and even help them redeem or demand rights by filing lawsuits against employers for workers' rights violations. Thus, these public servants inculcate migrants/refugees into the "routines" of their new capitalist, neoliberal, and highly legalistic/bureaucratic society (see Kurtz and Brooks 2008), with respect to everything from norms about punctuality, to the expectations they should maintain about their working conditions.

Multiple bureaucrats during interviews expressed the line that, "They are no longer in Venezuela," meaning they see their work as re-socializing migrants/refugees into a new society and its laws, in particular. For example, bureaucrats must explain Brazil has laws against domestic violence (*Lei Maria da Penha*, "Maria da Penha Law") and child abuse (*Estatuto da Criança e do Adolescente*, "Child and Adolescent Statute"), which are enforced and investigated when complaints are filed with the police. However, as Inés Valdez argues (2020), how the law is applied to migrant populations can attach domestic violence to the identity of "the migrant," rendering male migrants/refugees as subjects likely to engage in domestic violence. In other words, performing this labor positions street-level bureaucrats in an ethically tenuous position of shepherding these individuals through society, while trying to avoid reproducing discourses that

---

<sup>19</sup> Brazilian Interview 13, April 2023

connect these individuals automatically to notions of domestic violence. Moreover, women's rights violations, domestic violence, and child abuse, are issues not completely resolved either amongst Brazil's non-migrant/refugee population.

A fine line then emerges here between a public servant who is disseminating norms/customs and tendencies that verge on paternalism, or overreach by these actors into the lives of migrants/refugees. Stated differently, most of the bureaucrats I interviewed viewed themselves as benevolent actors, or at least as acting out of good intentions, but this does not preclude their potential role as agents of social control or discipline, following a Foucauldian view of governmentality. Brazilian bureaucrats then must constantly reflect on their position of power as an agent of the state, and how they use that power, to avoid overstepping their authority as they engage in the labor of governmentality. Or as Cecilia, a public servant in the state of Maranhão, recounted about her experience helping resettled Indigenous Venezuelan migrants/refugees:

There are LGBTQA+ people [in this Indigenous migrant community] and issues of masculinity, domination, and people who have mental illnesses because of the trip to Brazil, and problems with alcoholism, so our office deals with all of this. But many of them escape from the hospital when they are sick and go looking for a Shaman and later die. Diabetic people who are not used to needles and are admitted to hospitals, I don't know if it's the right word but they are not used to being "trapped" in hospitals. They are not used to the diet in hospitals, taking medication, so they don't like hospitals. They have a different understanding of life, health, death – so we have a sick body with a virus – but this body lives within a culture. And we have already had to call the firefighters and such to respond – it is not ideal and we don't like it, but here's a guy, for instance, who was stabbed and refuses to go to the hospital and what were we supposed to do?...And we had one case of an Indigenous man who was alcoholic and we didn't want to intervene and place him in a hospital out of respect for his culture, but he ended up dying, and I think at times well we respected his wishes, but maybe if we had intervened, we could have saved that life [*eyes tearing up*]. – Cecilia<sup>20</sup>

From Cecilia's testimony, as well as the testimonies above, we can see these street-level bureaucrats hold a considerable amount of power over the lives of the migrants/refugees they are charged with assisting. Nevertheless, these nuanced stories illustrate how these situations are not "easy," as many of these bureaucrats come to form deep bonds with the members of these migrant/refugee community, and must put aside their own emotions to respect these individuals

---

<sup>20</sup> Brazilian Interview 138, March 2023

and their cultural preferences, as Cecilia tearing up while retelling the story of the now-deceased man reveals. Furthermore, as Cecilia also explains, her and other Brazilian street-level bureaucrats, oftentimes have limited or blunt bureaucratic tools at their disposal to respond to the numerous vulnerabilities before them as they work to integrate migrants/refugees into a new culture.

### **Searching for Resources and Connecting Migrants/Refugees to Resources**

This limitation of resources and tools pushes local bureaucrats to search for new resources to make their efforts more efficacious, by connecting migrant/refugee populations in their municipalities to other forms of assistance. This process includes grant writing for additional funding from the federal government or international organizations; acting as a bridge between migrants/refugees and civil society or private organizations and employers; producing research, reports, and other publications on migrants/refugees and their needs; and writing digital and print pamphlets or guides for migrants/refugees on local laws, customs, and/or resources and how to access them. Or as Petra also recounted:

We organized a welcoming event with our local civil society volunteer group... We did another project, which was a clothing drive where migrants could go and pick out their own clothes from donated items. We also formed partnerships with churches, social institutions in the municipality, all of this basically preparing a large task force to welcome these migrants... Then, we created a task force to connect them to public services: healthcare, education, and social assistance. We created a large task force with volunteers and employers to translate and prepare their resumes. And fostered contacts with businesspeople to try to get them job openings... And with all this, we had a period of six months to emancipate them, which was the time they had their rent paid for by UNHCR. – Petra<sup>21</sup>

We can gauge how Petra and her colleagues worked to overcome resource constraints and help hundreds of resettled Venezuelan migrants/refugees find gainful employment and housing in a short period of time, by searching for contacts within the community and building bridges between them and these Venezuelan immigrant groups. The process of “emancipating” these individuals,

---

<sup>21</sup> Brazilian Interview 16, April 2023

or decreasing their direct reliance on the state, and its resources, required the dedicated work of these bureaucrats who worked to find other resources, by raising awareness about migrant/refugee needs and contacting possible partners. Stated differently, the type of governmentality or “care” that migrants/refugees, at times, require is rather substantial, due to their degree of vulnerability, pushing street-level bureaucrats to creatively find multiple other public and private resources to meet their needs. Bureaucrats here, once again, chose to engage in these tasks that entail extra research, paperwork, coordination, and labor for them, beyond their customary duties.

Or as Deliany, a public servant in Brasilia, elucidates:

Our job is to have an idea of where this person is going [to look for work or housing] to make them aware or ring alarm bells about the possibility of ending up in working conditions that are akin to modern-day slavery [*trabalho análogo a escravidão*], because it is common for immigrants to receive this type of proposal and sometimes they don't know, so we ask them where they're going, then you research whether it's a known [human trafficking] route, and then you can already direct these people to other local government agencies if you know where the person is going. Another thing we do in this initial meeting with migrants is to sign them up for the *cadastro único*... [When migrants first arrive] we always have a norm, which is that we have our own database to include what the person's degrees are, their coursework and other professional skills, because then we can provide guidance for them about looking for a job. We have printed and digital materials that we immediately send them about labor rights, so people can try to avoid getting themselves in an exploitative situation. We know that this is not always possible, often due to necessity, especially for an immigrant, as he ends up having fewer options, he sometimes submits himself to these poor working conditions, but we play the role of explaining this is not correct, explaining the pathways out of those situations. – Deliany<sup>22</sup>

*Cadastro Único* (“Singular Registry”) is a centralized platform and databank operated by the Brazilian federal government, which includes all individuals and families in need and streamlines their access to a variety of public services, based on the answers they provide during their registry process. However, despite *Cadastro Único*'s aim for universal reach, Deliany's testimony illustrates how she, and her colleagues, still conduct their own data management to connect migrants/refugees to more local resources that this federal, more encompassing, registry might miss. Thus, these street-level bureaucrats develop their own biopolitical tools and data management strategies to more effectively deliver care for migrants/refugees, while expanding the

---

<sup>22</sup> Brazilian Interview 52, May 2023

state's governance reach at the local, grassroots level. Likewise, during my fieldwork, it was common to see in municipal government offices and NGOs, numerous pamphlets and publications produced by local staff to inform migrants/refugees about specific issues they may encounter or local, state, and federal government resources. Deliany's interview also sheds light on the ethical balance local officials must strike as they connect individuals to resources, knowing the individual may completely ignore their recommendations. Deliany's testimony suggests she prioritizes respecting the individual's agency, while raising awareness about their rights and making herself available to assist them as circumstances change in the future.

Beatriz, a public official in the Porto Alegre metropolitan area, also remarked on this ethical dilemma.

We had a Venezuelan who died this year due to an illness [HIV/AIDS] he came with and he didn't want to undergo treatment, it was for an issue that still faces a lot of social prejudice and stigma...We had many Venezuelans who were bisexual, but who did not say so at the beginning due to these issues of prejudice among them. The prejudice among the Venezuelan men themselves...was very strong...so much so that, at first, we didn't think about segregating these two or three who said they were homosexuals, but then because we had this prejudice and they started to suffer discrimination, we created a room just for them in the shelter...There were health issues also, many came with sexually transmitted diseases, dental issues, healthcare treatment issues that were very precarious [in Venezuela]...But because they didn't want to be exposed, they ended up not treating [HIV/AIDS] because that would require going to a specific local service, and taking a specific medication. We had more than one of those types of cases...they thought that since they had a partner in the shelter, and with the prejudice that existed among them, they preferred not to take the medication. – Beatriz<sup>23</sup>

Beatriz's testimony showcases the complex efforts that go into connecting migrants/refugees to resources. Bureaucrats are not only trying to connect these individuals to labor, clothing, and other resources; but also dealing with nuanced needs in terms of healthcare, orthodontic needs, and even long-term treatment plans. Beatriz here reflects on her experience assisting an individual who was HIV positive, but refused to seek out retroviral medication for fear of social isolation, if his status were revealed within the Venezuelan migrants'/refugees' shelter. This adds another level of ethical nuance to these tasks, as public officials must navigate cultural norms and forms of discrimination

---

<sup>23</sup> Brazilian Interview 24, May 2023

even within and among migrant/refugee communities that can negatively impact who receives certain resources, even when bureaucrats are able to locate them. This example deals with homophobia and sexual identity that leads to social exclusion and an inability for street-level bureaucrats to deliver care even though they have connected the migrant/refugee to local resources, but one could envision other examples with gender, religion, class, race, disability, and so forth.

### **(RE)THINKING BUREAUCRACY AND MIGRANT/REFUGEE INTEGRATION**

This article provides a throughline between two distinct narratives about global migration. One, which right-wing forces have ruthlessly demagogued over the past few decades, is that surges in migrant/refugee flows “swamp” host states and create considerable challenges for communities in border states and for large urban cities. The second narrative, largely espoused by developmental economists and technocrats, is that migrants/refugees are unequivocally necessary for economic growth – through their labor force participation, spending, and tax contributions – and, especially so, for aging societies. My argument, and case study above, present how either narrative can come to pass, depending on specific other factors and variables. Migrants/refugees can cause short-term issues within municipal and local public services if they are not adequately incorporated into these communities, or if local street-level bureaucrats do not possess the agency or power to find creative solutions to meet their needs. On the other hand, migrants/refugees can be more smoothly incorporated into local labor markets, housing markets, and public services in spaces where legal and policy realms are more conducive to this process. However, my point here is that it is not pre-existing laws, or policies, or Adam Smith’s invisible hand that fully allow migrants/refugees in the latter scenario to find jobs and figure out how to access public goods/services. Instead, there is a

component or force within the state apparatus that considerably impacts – or at the very least – expedites this process: the bureaucrat.

To that end, the previous sections have delineated, via in-depth interview material and by remarking on numerous forms of social vulnerability, the role that Brazilian street-level bureaucrats play in the state's response to Venezuelan migration over the past few years. Theoretically, I have sketched out a different relationship between immigration and state-building than previously emphasized in the literature, by showcasing the unique techniques through which state employees engage in the strengthening of bureaucratic functions. These techniques are easy to miss if one focuses purely on quantitative indicators of migrant/refugee integration or state public service delivery rates. Moreover, I have presented the ethical dilemmas that arise and how street-level bureaucrats approach migrants/refugees to solve complex problems in situations where acting with indifference, or simply relying on the blunt power of the state with its pre-existing laws, policies, and resources, would not solve the issue. A central takeaway from this process is that the intimate, quotidian interactions between Brazilian street-level bureaucrats and Venezuelan migrants/refugees, position these bureaucrats to advocate on migrants'/refugees' behalf for policy changes, legal inclusion, and more training for their colleagues, in spaces and meetings where migrant/refugee voices are absent due to language and other barriers. This labor might seem rather incremental and miniscule, but as the above excerpts reveal, it produces long-lasting changes in how healthcare, education, food and legal assistance, and other public services are provided to these vulnerable groups. Lastly, by outlining the power and agency of individual bureaucrats in these day-to-day activities, I have shown how even immigration policy – which is usually framed as a highly inflexible or intractable area of almost exclusively federal public policy control – is



still subject to the relations of power and individual choices that characterize the state-individual relationship at the municipal, grassroots level.

Brazil's response to Venezuelan migration elucidates how street-level bureaucrats can function in times of migratory influxes to reduce anti-immigrant sentiments, political violence, and social marginalization. These lessons are important for this case study of Venezuelan migration, but are also worthy of examination and contemplation for how states respond to migration influxes from Afghanistan, Syria, Ukraine, and even Venezuelan migration to other states. Furthermore, the June 2024 European Parliament elections saw a surge of far-right electoral gains, partially fueled by anti-migration rhetoric, and later in the Summer we also witnessed anti-immigrant riots across the United Kingdom. During the same time, President Joe Biden announced the temporary closure of the U.S. Southern border to new asylum claims, and previously, in 2021, the governors of Iowa and South Dakota made headlines for refusing to host migrants/refugees the federal government was hoping to resettle in their states. Thus, increasingly municipal, provincial, and national governments around the world are responding to migration by saying they are *unable* to cope with the demands that migrants/refugees place on the state and its public services at the expense of native populations. This logic misses the role of seemingly unimportant street-level bureaucrats and bureaucracies in responding to migratory movements and how their choices to incorporate these individuals by going above and beyond their job expectations can lead to a reduction in anti-immigration backlash *or not*. As I have demonstrated, coping with migratory influxes does not necessarily depend on budgets, technology, or resources – but rather it can depend on the willingness and meticulous labor of often ignored political actors. Finally, states and bureaucracies that choose not to respond to or host migrants/refugees fail to take advantage of the opportunities for bureaucratic learning and state transformation that these responses offer.

## REFERENCES

- Adida, Claire. 2014. *Immigrant Exclusion and Insecurity in Africa: Coethnic Strangers*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Alvarez, Sonia. 1990. *Engendering Democracy in Brazil: Women's Movements in Transition Politics*. Princeton: Princeton University Press.
- Auerbach, Adam. 2019. *Demanding Development: The Politics of Public Goods Provision in India's Urban Slums*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Basaran, Tugba, and Christian Olsson. 2018. "Becoming International: On Symbolic Capital, Conversion and Privilege." *Millennium* 46(2): 96-118.
- Bautista-Chavez, Angie. 2020. "The Domestic and International Politics of U.S. Immigration Policy." Harvard University, Unpublished Doctoral Dissertation.
- Bloemraad, Irene. 2006. *Becoming a Citizen: Incorporating Immigrants and Refugees in the United States and Canada*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Bourdieu, Pierre. 1984. *Distinction: A Social Critique of the Judgment of Taste*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press.
- \_\_\_\_\_. 1986. "The Forms of Capital," in *Handbook of Theory and Research for the Sociology of Education*, John Richardson, ed. New York: Greenwood Press. Pp. 241-258.
- Charnysh, Volha. 2019. "Diversity, Institutions, and Economic Outcomes: Post-WWII Displacement in Poland." *American Political Science Review* 113(2): 423-441.
- Dancygier, Rafaela. 2010. *Immigration and Conflict in Europe*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Ding, Iza. 2020. "Performative Governance." *World Politics* 72(4): 525-556.

- Emeriau, Mathilde. 2023. "Learning to be Unbiased: Evidence from the French Asylum Office." *American Journal of Political Science* 67(4): 1117-1133.
- Eriksen Rio, Anna. 2024. "Revisiting the Case of Ethnography and International Relations." *Millennium*, Online first.
- Ettlinger, Nancy. 2011. "Governmentality as Epistemology." *Annals of the Association of American Geographers* 101(3): 537-560.
- Fenno, Richard. 1978. *Home Style: House Members in their Districts*. Boston: Little, Brown, and Co.
- Fenwick, Clare. 2019. "The Political Economy of Immigration and Welfare State Effort: Evidence from Europe." *European Political Science Review* 11(3): 357-375.
- Foucault, Michel. 1980. *Power/Knowledge: Selected Interviews and Other Writings 1972-1977*, Colin Gordon, ed. New York: Pantheon.
- \_\_\_\_\_. 1984. "Right of Death and Power over Life." In *The Foucault Reader*, Paul Rabinow, ed., New York: Pantheon, p. 258-272.
- \_\_\_\_\_. 2001. *Power: Essential Works of Foucault, 1954-1984*, James D. Faubion, ed. Robert Hurley and others, trans. New York: The New Press.
- \_\_\_\_\_. 2003. *Society Must be Defended: Lectures at the Collège de France 1975-1976*, transl. D. Macey. New York: Picador.
- Fouka, Vasiliki. 2019. "How Do Immigrants Respond to Discrimination? The Case of Germans in the US During World War I." *American Political Science Review* 113(2): 405-422.
- Freier, Luisa, Nicholas Micinski, and Gerasimos Tsourapas. 2021. "Refugee Commodification: The Diffusion of Refugee Rent-seeking in the Global South." *Third World Quarterly* 42(11): 2747-2766.

- Freire, Paulo. 2023[1968]. *Pedagogia do Oprimido*. Rio de Janeiro: Terra e Paz.
- Fujii, Lee Ann. 2010. "Shades of Truth and Lies: Interpreting Testimonies of War and Violence." *Journal of Peace Research* 47(2): 231-241.
- Gaikwad, Nikhar, and Gareth Nellis. 2017. "The Majority-Minority Divide in Attitudes toward Internal Migration: Evidence from Mumbai." *American Journal of Political Science* 61(2): 456-472.
- Gaikwad, Nikhar, and Gareth Nellis. 2021. "Do Politicians Discriminate Against Internal Migrants? Evidence from Nationwide Field Experiments in India." *American Journal of Political Science* 65(4): 790-806.
- Geertz, Clifford. 1973. *The Interpretation of Cultures*. New York: Basic Books.
- González, Yanilda. 2017. "'What Citizens Can See of the State': Police and the Construction of Democratic Citizenship in Latin America." *Theoretical Criminology* 21(4): 494-511.
- \_\_\_\_\_. 2019. "The Social Origins of Institutional Weakness and Change: Preferences, Power, and Police Reform in Latin America." *World Politics* 71(1): 44-87.
- Goodman, J. David, et al. 2024. "Bus by Bus, Texas' Governor Changes Migration Across the U.S." *The New York Times* July 20. Available at: <https://www.nytimes.com/2024/07/20/us/abbott-texas-migrant-buses.html#> Accessed on: July 22 2024.
- Herrera, Yoshiko. 2010. *Mirrors of the Economy: National Accounts and International Norms in Russia and Beyond*. Ithaca: Cornell University Press.
- Ho, Carmen Jacqueline. 2022. "Benevolent Policies: Bureaucratic Politics and the International Dimensions of Social Policy Expansion," *American Political Science Review* 116(2): 615-630.

- Holland, Alisha. 2017. *Forbearance as Redistribution: The Politics of Informal Welfare in Latin America*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- \_\_\_\_\_. 2018. "Diminished Expectations: Redistributive Preferences in Truncated Welfare States." *World Politics* 70(4): 555–594.
- Holland, Alisha, Margaret Peters, and Yang-Yang Zhou. 2023. "Left Out: How Political Ideology Affects Support for Migrants in Colombia." *Journal of Politics*, Forthcoming.
- Idler, Annette. 2020. "The Logic of Illicit Flows in Armed Conflict: Explaining Variation in Violent Nonstate Group Interactions in Colombia." *World Politics* 72(3): 335-376.
- Kapiszewski, Diana, Lauren MacLean, and Benjamin Read. 2015. *Field Research in Political Science: Practices and Principles*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Kim, Diana. 2020. *Empires of Vice: The Rise of Opium Prohibition across Southeast Asia*. Princeton: Princeton University Press.
- Kurtz, Marcus and Sarah Brooks. 2008. "Embedding Neoliberal Reform in Latin America." *World Politics* 60(2): 231-280.
- Leech, Beth. 2002. "Asking Questions: Techniques for Semistructured Interviews." *PS: Political Science and Politics* 35(4): 663-688.
- Lipsky, Michael. 2010. *Street-Level Bureaucracy: Dilemmas of the Individual in Public Services*. New York: Russell Sage Foundation.
- Mangla, Akshay. 2022. *Making Bureaucracy Work: Norms, Education and Public Service Delivery in Rural India*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- McMurdo, Anne-Marie. 2016. "Causes and Consequences of Canada's Resettlement of Syrian Refugees." *Forced Migration Review* 52: 82-84.

- McNamee, Lachlan and Anna Zhang. 2019. "Demographic Engineering and International Conflict: Evidence from China and the Former USSR." *International Organization* 73(2): 291-327.
- Mosley, Layna, ed. 2013. *Interview Research in Political Science*. Ithaca: Cornell University Press.
- Nathan, Noah. 2023. *The Scarce State: Inequality and Political Power in the Hinterland*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Norman, Kelsey. 2021. *Reluctant Reception: Refugees, Migration and Governance in the Middle East and North Africa*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Nunes, Rodrigo. 2021. *Neither Vertical nor Horizontal: A Theory of Political Organization*. Brooklyn: Verso Books.
- Oktay, Julianne. 2012. *Grounded Theory*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Potter, Rachel Augustine. 2019. *Bending the Rules: Procedural Politicking in the Bureaucracy*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- R4V. 2024. "Informe de Interiorização – Janeiro/2024." February 26. Available at: <https://www.r4v.info/pt/document/informe-de-interiorizacao-janeiro-2024> Accessed on: Feb 26 2024.
- Rueda, David, and Daniel Stegmüller. 2016. "The Externalities of Inequality: Fear of Crime and Preferences for Redistribution in Western Europe." *American Journal of Political Science* 60(2): 472-489.
- Salehyan, Idean, and Kristian Skrede Gleditsch. 2006. "Refugees and the Spread of Civil War." *International Organization* 60(2): 335-366.

- Schatz, Edward, ed. 2013. *Political Ethnography: What Immersion Contributes to the Study of Power*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Schwartz, Stephanie. 2019. "Home, Again: Refugee Return and Post-conflict Violence in Burundi." *International Security* 44(2): 110-145.
- Scott, James. 1987. *Weapons of the Weak: Everyday Forms of Peasant Formation*. New Haven: Yale University Press.
- Stokes, Susan. 1995. *Cultures in Conflict: Social Movements and the State in Peru*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Tummers, Lars, and Victor Bekkers. "Policy Implementation, Street-level bureaucracy, and the Importance of Discretion." *Public Management Review* 16.4 (2014): 527-547.
- Valdez, Inés. 2020. "Reconceiving Immigration Politics: Walter Benjamin, Violence, and Labor." *American Political Science Review* 114(1): 95-108.
- Van Evera, Stephen. 1997. *Guide to Methods for Students of Political Science*. Ithaca: Cornell University Press.
- Vrasti, Wanda. 2008. "The Strange Case of Ethnography and International Relations." *Millennium* 37(2): 279-301.
- Weber, Max. 1978. *Economy and Society*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Wedeen, Lisa. 1999. *Ambiguities of Domination: Politics, Rhetoric, and Symbols in Contemporary Syria*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Williamson, Abigail Fisher. 2018. *Welcoming New Americans? Local Governments and Immigrant Incorporation*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Wood, Elisabeth Jean. 2003. *Insurgent Collective Action and Civil War in El Salvador*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

- \_\_\_\_\_. 2009. "Field Research." In *The Oxford Handbook of Comparative Politics*, Carles Boix and Susan Stokes, eds. Oxford: Oxford University Press, pp. 123-146.
- Zacka, Bernardo. 2017. *When the State Meets the Street: Public Service and Moral Agency*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press.
- \_\_\_\_\_. 2022. "Political Theory Rediscovered Public Administration." *Annual Review of Political Science* 25(1): 21-42.
- Zhou, Yang-Yang. 2023. "How Refugee Resentment Shapes National Identity and Citizen Participation." *Working Paper*.
- Zhou, Yang-Yang and Jason Lyall. 2023. "Prolonged Contact Does Not Improve Locals' Relations with Migrants in Wartime Settings." *American Journal of Political Science*, Forthcoming.
- Zhou, Yang-Yang, Guy Grossman, and Shuning Ge. 2023. "Inclusive Refugee-hosting Can Improve Local Development and Prevent Public Backlash." *World Development* 166: 106203.



## Methodological Appendices

<u>Contents</u>	<u>Page</u>
Appendix 1 – Semi-structured Interviews with Brazilian Participants	2
Appendix 2 – Semi-structured Interviews with Venezuelan Participants	7
Appendix 3 – Participant Observations	12

<u>Key</u>	<u>Abbreviation</u>
International Organization	IO
Non-governmental Organization	NGO
University of Brasília	UnB

### Summary of Research Design and Methods

The following appendices describe in detail the methods employed and data collected for this project. Specifically, I carried out 290 semi-structured interviews (150 with Brazilians of interest and 140 with Venezuelan migrants) across 5 in-person field sites and a “Miscellaneous” virtual field site in Brazil. I also conducted 60 formal participant observations. The list of participant observations is not exhaustive, but rather reflects the moments and conversations that became most memorable. Interviews and participant observations below are listed in chronological order and by field site. Semi-structured interview participants were recruited via snowball sampling of my own network of contacts, and then relying on interviewees to recruit other potential participants. However, in all 5 field sites I did partner with local NGOs to recruit some Venezuelan participants, which were individuals that came randomly into the NGO looking for some sort of service or assistance, thereby creating randomness in that sample.

For Brazilian and Venezuelan participants, I have listed a pseudonym, an approximation of their age, a month-year of interview participation, and a non-specific job title to protect their confidentiality. Brazilian interviewees included 82 (54.67%) females, 67 (44.67%) males, and 1 (0.66%) gender non-binary participant, with 30s as their average age, and an average interview time of 45 minutes. Venezuelan interviewees were 81 (57.86%) females, 57 (40.71%) males, and 2 (1.43%) transgender participants, with 30s as their average age, and average interview time of 35 minutes. I have also indicated how the interview was conducted, either in-person or virtually, depending on the person’s availability and preference. Almost all interviews were audio recorded and professionally transcribed to ensure accuracy. Venezuelan participants were interviewed in Spanish, and almost all Brazilian participants were interviewed in Portuguese, except a few that are native speakers of Spanish or English and choose to be interviewed in those languages. The researcher is fluent in English, Portuguese, and Spanish, and conducted all interviews and participant observations.

All data was gathered during a 2-month exploratory field work trip to Brasilia and Porto Alegre during 2022 to gain background knowledge, refine research design, and gather preliminary contacts. This exploratory field work trip was then followed by a formal fieldwork trip of 10-months in 2023 where I visited Porto Alegre, Brasilia, Boa Vista, Manaus, and São Paulo, in that order. In total, 12 months of field work went into the elaboration of this project.

**Appendix 1 – Semi-structured Interviews with Brazilian Participants**

<b>Field Site 1 - Porto Alegre</b>							
<i>File Name</i>	<i>Date</i>	<i>Pseudonym</i>	<i>Gender</i>	<i>Age approx.</i>	<i>Duration</i>	<i>Format</i>	<i>Profession or Status</i>
Brazilian Interview 1	23-Mar	Marcelo	Male	30s	45 mins.	Café	Immigration lawyer
Brazilian Interview 2	23-Mar	Daiane Antonia	Female	20s	35 mins.	Zoom	Researcher, Labor rights lawyer
Brazilian Interview 3	23-Mar	Clarisse	Female	30s	1 hour	Café	School teacher to Venezuelan migrants
Brazilian Interview 4	23-Mar	Paula	Female	30s	1 hour	Café	School teacher to Venezuelan migrants
Brazilian Interview 5	23-Mar	Andrea Maria	Female	50s	1 hour	Café	Immigration lawyer
Brazilian Interview 6	23-Mar	Isabella	Female	20s	30 mins.	Google meet	State public servant
Brazilian Interview 7	23-Mar	Lorenzo	Male	50s	50 mins.	Google meet	Military officer
Brazilian Interview 8	23-Mar	Tamara	Female	30s	1.45 hours	Café	NGO employee
Brazilian Interview 9	23-Mar	Danielle	Female	30s	1 hour	Google meet	NGO employee
Brazilian Interview 10	23-Mar	Vinicius	Male	40s	50 mins.	Google meet	NGO employee, researcher, lawyer
Brazilian Interview 11	23-Mar	Alexandre	Male	30s	1.5 hours	Café	Civil society organization member
Brazilian Interview 12	23-Mar	João José	Male	30s	1 hour	Office	Civil society organization employee
Brazilian Interview 13	23-Apr	Heloisa	Female	50s	45 mins.	Google meet	Municipal public servant
Brazilian Interview 14	23-Apr	Marilza	Female	40s	45 mins.	Google meet	NGO employee, researcher, professor
Brazilian Interview 15	23-Apr	Fabio José	Male	40s	1 hour	Office	Municipal politician
Brazilian Interview 16	23-Apr	Petra	Female	40s	1 hour	Office	Municipal public servant
Brazilian Interview 17	23-Apr	Juliet	Female	50s	1 hour	Office	Municipal public servant
Brazilian Interview 18	23-Apr	Valentina	Female	50s	45 mins.	Office	Municipal public servant
Brazilian Interview 19	23-Apr	Heloisa	Female	50s	1 hour	Office	Municipal public servant
Brazilian Interview 20	23-Apr	Claudinettes	Female	30s	1 hour	Office	Municipal public servant
Brazilian Interview 21	23-Apr	Marcia Fernanda	Female	50s	1 hour	Office	Municipal public servant
Brazilian Interview 22	23-Apr	Igor	Male	30s	1 hour	Google meet	NGO employee
Brazilian Interview 23	23-Apr	Raimundo Matt	Male	40s	30 mins.	Google meet	Municipal politician
Brazilian Interview 24	23-May	Beatriz	Female	40s	1 hour	Office	Municipal public servant
Brazilian Interview 25	23-May	Narcisa	Female	40s	1 hour	Office	Municipal public servant
Brazilian Interview 26	23-May	Daisy	Female	40s	1 hour	Office	Municipal public servant
Brazilian Interview 27	23-May	Sasha	Female	20s	30 mins.	Google meet	Municipal public servant
Brazilian Interview 28	23-May	Anderson	Male	50s	45 mins.	Google meet	Church leader/Pastor/Nun

Brazilian Interview 29	23-May	Nicole	Female	40s	30 mins.	Google meet	Municipal public servant
Brazilian Interview 30	23-May	Rodrigo	Male	30s	1 hour	Office	Municipal politician
Brazilian Interview 31	23-May	Fabrizio	Male	30s	1 hour	Office	Church leader/Pastor/Nun
Brazilian Interview 32	23-May	Tony	Male	40s	30 mins.	Office	Municipal politician
Brazilian Interview 33	23-May	Valerio	Male	50s	45 mins.	Office	Municipal politician
Brazilian Interview 34	23-May	Amanda Camila	Female	40s	45 mins.	Office	Municipal public servant
Brazilian Interview 35	23-Jun	Eliane	Female	30s	45 mins.	Google meet	Municipal public servant
Brazilian Interview 36	23-Jun	Lisete	Female	60s	30 mins.	Google meet	Municipal politician
<b>Field Site 2 - Brasilia</b>							
<i>File Name</i>	<i>Date</i>	<i>Pseudonym</i>	<i>Gender</i>	<i>Age approx.</i>	<i>Duration</i>	<i>Format</i>	<i>Profession or Status</i>
Brazilian Interview 37	23-Mar	Fabio	Male	40s	45 mins.	Zoom	Federal public servant
Brazilian Interview 38	23-Mar	Otavio	Male	40s	40 mins.	Google meet	Church leader/Pastor/Nun
Brazilian Interview 39	23-May	Marlene	Female	60s	1 hour	Google meet	NGO employee
Brazilian Interview 40	23-May	Ofelia	Female	50s	30 mins.	Office	Federal public servant
Brazilian Interview 41	23-May	Timoteo	Male	50s	1 hour	Office	NGO employee
Brazilian Interview 42	23-May	Eduardo	Male	20s	45 mins.	Google meet	NGO employee
Brazilian Interview 43	23-May	Elivandro	Male	40s	1 hour	Office	Federal public servant
Brazilian Interview 44	23-May	Miguel	Male	50s	1 hour	Office	Military officer
Brazilian Interview 45	23-May	Sebastião	Male	50s	1 hour	Office	Military officer
Brazilian Interview 46	23-May	Gael	Male	30s	45 mins.	Office	NGO employee
Brazilian Interview 47	23-May	Theo	Male	50s	30 mins.	Office	Federal politician
Brazilian Interview 48	23-May	Roberta	Female	50s	45 mins.	Google meet	NGO employee
Brazilian Interview 49	23-May	Diogo	Male	50s	45 mins.	Google meet	IO employee
Brazilian Interview 50	23-May	Martina Juana	Female	50s	1 hour	Google meet	NGO employee
Brazilian Interview 51	23-May	Analise	Female	40s	45 mins.	Google meet	Municipal public servant
Brazilian Interview 52	23-May	Deliany	Female	30s	45 mins.	Google meet	Municipal public servant
Brazilian Interview 53	23-Aug	Roland	Male	20s	30 mins.	Google meet	IO employee
Brazilian Interview 54	23-Sep	Basilio José	Male	30s	30 mins.	Google meet	Federal public servant
Brazilian Interview 55	23-Nov	Zenilde	Female	30s	30 mins.	Google meet	Federal public servant/ Volunteer
<b>Field Site 3 - Boa Vista</b>							
<i>File Name</i>	<i>Date</i>	<i>Pseudonym</i>	<i>Gender</i>	<i>Age approx.</i>	<i>Duration</i>	<i>Format</i>	<i>Profession or Status</i>
Brazilian Interview 56	23-Mar	Vitor	Male	20s	1 hour	Google meet	NGO employee

Brazilian Interview 57	23-Mar	Raquel	Female	20s	30 mins.	Google meet	NGO employee
Brazilian Interview 58	23-Apr	Claudia	Female	20s	30 mins.	Google meet	NGO employee
Brazilian Interview 59	23-Apr	Heitor	Male	30s	25 mins.	Google meet	NGO employee
Brazilian Interview 60	23-Jun	Leandro	Male	30s	1 hour	Office	NGO employee
Brazilian Interview 61	23-Jun	Martim	Male	50s	1 hour	Office	Researcher
Brazilian Interview 62	23-Jun	Angelica	Female	30s	1 hour	Café	IO employee
Brazilian Interview 63	23-Jun	Walter	Male	40s	30 mins.	Google meet	Military officer
Brazilian Interview 64	23-Jun	Simone Natalia	Female	40s	1 hour	Office	Church leader/Pastor/Nun
Brazilian Interview 65	23-Jun	Carlota	Female	50s	1 hour	Office	NGO employee
Brazilian Interview 66	23-Jun	Cassimiro	Male	30s	1 hour	Google meet	IO employee
Brazilian Interview 67	23-Jun	Gaspar	Male	50s	1 hour	Office	Church leader/Pastor/Nun
Brazilian Interview 68	23-Jun	Berenice	Female	30s	45 mins.	Office	NGO employee
Brazilian Interview 69	23-Jul	Margarete	Female	20s	30 mins.	Google meet	IO employee
Brazilian Interview 70	23-Jul	Tarcísio	Male	50s	45 mins.	Google meet	Military officer
Brazilian Interview 71	23-Jul	Anastasia	Female	30s	30 mins.	Google meet	State public servant
Brazilian Interview 72	23-Nov	Isabel Maria	Female	30s	45 mins.	Google meet	IO employee
<b>Field Site 4 - Manaus</b>							
<i>File Name</i>	<i>Date</i>	<i>Pseudonym</i>	<i>Gender</i>	<i>Age approx.</i>	<i>Duration</i>	<i>Format (City)</i>	<i>Profession or Status</i>
Brazilian Interview 73	23-Jun	Alex	Male	30s	1 hour	Office	NGO employee
Brazilian Interview 74	23-Jun	Helena	Female	50s	1.5 hours	Café	State public servant
Brazilian Interview 75	23-Jun	Mario José	Male	20s	30 mins	Office	NGO employee
Brazilian Interview 76	23-Jun	Emma	Female	20s	45 mins.	Office	NGO employee
Brazilian Interview 77	23-Jun	Joaquim	Male	20s	30 mins.	Office	NGO employee
Brazilian Interview 78	23-Jun	Zenaide	Female	50s	1.5 hours	Office	State public servant/ IO employee
Brazilian Interview 79	23-Jun	Cesar	Male	20s	30 mins.	Office	NGO employee
Brazilian Interview 80	23-Jun	Angelina	Female	40s	45 mins.	Office	NGO employee
Brazilian Interview 81	23-Jun	Genoveva	Female	30s	30 mins.	Office	IO employee
Brazilian Interview 82	23-Jun	Cristovão	Male	20s	30 mins.	Office	NGO employee
Brazilian Interview 83	23-Jun	Yonathan	Male	20s	30 mins.	Office	NGO employee
Brazilian Interview 84	23-Jul	Dylan	Male	20s	30 mins	Office	IO employee
Brazilian Interview 85	23-Jul	Jacinto	Male	20s	30 mins.	Office	NGO employee
Brazilian Interview 86	23-Jul	Claudia Rosa	Female	50s	45 mins.	Office	NGO employee

Brazilian Interview 87	23-Jul	Portia	Female	50s	30 mins.	Office	NGO employee
Brazilian Interview 88	23-Jul	Vania	Female	40s	1 hour	Office	Federal public servant
Brazilian Interview 89	23-Jul	Roxanne	Female	20s	30 mins.	Office	NGO employee
Brazilian Interview 90	23-Jul	Waldemar	Male	40s	30 mins.	Office	NGO volunteer teacher
Brazilian Interview 91	23-Jul	Celeste	Female	60s	45 mins.	Office	Church leader/Pastor/Nun
Brazilian Interview 92	23-Jul	Anselmo	Male	20s	30 mins.	Office	NGO employee
Brazilian Interview 93	23-Jul	Eunicio	Male	40s	30 mins.	Office	NGO employee
Brazilian Interview 94	23-Jul	Samantha	Female	20s	30 mins.	Office	NGO employee
Brazilian Interview 95	23-Jul	Orfeu	Male	40s	45 mins.	Office	NGO employee
Brazilian Interview 96	23-Jul	Tiburcio	Male	40s	30 mins.	Office	Cuban migrant in Manaus
Brazilian Interview 97	23-Aug	Nayana	Female	20s	30 mins.	Office	State public servant
Brazilian Interview 98	23-Aug	Filomena	Female	20s	45 mins.	Office	State public servant
Brazilian Interview 99	23-Sep	Stella	Female	40s	30 mins.	Google meet	Municipal public servant
Brazilian Interview 100	23-Sep	Nazare	Female	40s	30 mins	Google meet	Municipal public servant
Brazilian Interview 101	23-Sep	Antonietta	Female	30s	30 mins.	Google meet	NGO employee
Brazilian Interview 102	23-Sep	Fatima	Female	50s	45 mins.	Google meet	Municipal public servant
Brazilian Interview 103	23-Sep	Pedro Paulo	Male	20s	30 mins.	Google meet	NGO employee
Brazilian Interview 104	23-Sep	Carmela	Female	40s	30 mins	Google meet	Municipal public servant
Brazilian Interview 105	23-Sep	Suzanne	Female	50s	30 mins.	Google meet	Municipal public servant
<b>Field Site 5 - São Paulo</b>							
<i>File Name</i>	<i>Date</i>	<i>Pseudonym</i>	<i>Gender</i>	<i>Age approx.</i>	<i>Duration</i>	<i>Format</i>	<i>Profession or Status</i>
Brazilian Interview 106	23-May	Arthur	Male	50s	30 mins.	Google meet	Federal-level public servant
Brazilian Interview 107	23-May	Richard	Male	50s	45 mins.	Google meet	NGO employee
Brazilian Interview 108	23-Sep	Ana Carolina	Female	30s	45 mins.	Office	NGO employee
Brazilian Interview 109	23-Sep	Basilio	Male	40s	30 mins.	Google meet	NGO employee, researcher
Brazilian Interview 110	23-Oct	Marcelino José	Male	50s	30 mins.	Office	Municipal politician
Brazilian Interview 111	23-Oct	Sandra Aline	Female	20s	30 mins.	Office	NGO employee
Brazilian Interview 112	23-Oct	Artemio	Male	30s	1 hour	Office	Municipal public servant
Brazilian Interview 113	23-Oct	Manuella	Female	30s	1 hour	Google meet	Municipal public servant
Brazilian Interview 114	23-Oct	Pedro João	Male	30s	1 hour	Google meet	Municipal public servant
Brazilian Interview 115	23-Oct	Josefa	Female	50s	30 mins.	Google meet	NGO employee

Brazilian Interview 116	23-Oct	Vera Martina	Female	30s	30 mins.	Google meet	Private sector employer for migrants
Brazilian Interview 117	23-Oct	Natalia	Female	30s	30 mins.	Google meet	Immigration lawyer
Brazilian Interview 118	23-Nov	Fulvio	Male	40s	30 mins.	Google meet	NGO employee
Brazilian Interview 119	23-Nov	Symena	Female	20s	1 hour	Café	IO employee
Brazilian Interview 120	23-Nov	Luiz Marcos	Male	30s	30 mins.	Google meet	Immigration lawyer
Brazilian Interview 121	23-Nov	Rosangelina	Female	30s	30 mins.	Office	NGO employee
Brazilian Interview 122	23-Nov	Anilda	Female	30s	45 mins.	Google meet	Municipal public servant, researcher
Brazilian Interview 123	23-Nov	Renata	Female	50s	30 mins.	Google meet	NGO employee, business leader
Brazilian Interview 124	23-Nov	Darlesiane	Female	50s	30 mins.	Google meet	Municipal public servant
Brazilian Interview 125	23-Nov	Natalina	Female	20s	30 mins.	Office	Municipal public servant
Brazilian Interview 126	23-Nov	Elanor	Female	70s	45 mins.	Office	Municipal politician
Brazilian Interview 127	23-Nov	Alex Antonio	Male	30s	30 mins.	Google meet	Journalist
Brazilian Interview 128	23-Nov	Nayara	Female	30s	30 mins.	Google meet	NGO employee
Brazilian Interview 129	23-Nov	Ludimila	Female	40s	30 mins.	Google meet	Municipal public servant
Brazilian Interview 130	23-Nov	Clausinete	Female	30s	30 mins.	Google meet	NGO volunteer
Brazilian Interview 131	23-Nov	Igor Flavio	Male	50s	30 mins.	Google meet	Church leader/Pastor/Nun
Brazilian Interview 132	23-Dec	Juricia	Female	40s	1 hour	Google meet	NGO employee
Brazilian Interview 133	23-Dec	Val	Female	50s	30 mins.	Google meet	NGO employee
Brazilian Interview 134	23-Dec	William	Male	50s	45 mins.	WhatsApp video call	Church leader/Pastor/Nun
Brazilian Interview 135	24-Jan	Edson Roberto	Male	50s	30 mins.	Google meet	Researcher/ NGO employee
Brazilian Interview 136	24-Feb	Fanny	Female	40s	30 mins.	Google meet	Federal politician
<b>Field Site 5 - Miscellaneous</b>							
<i>File Name</i>	<i>Date</i>	<i>Pseudonym</i>	<i>Gender</i>	<i>Age approx.</i>	<i>Duration</i>	<i>Format (State)</i>	<i>Profession or Status</i>
Brazilian Interview 137	23-Mar	Pedro	Male	30s	50 mins.	Google meet (Rio Grande do Norte)	State-level public servant
Brazilian Interview 138	23-Mar	Cecilia	Female	30s	40 mins.	Google meet (Maranhão)	Municipal public servant
Brazilian Interview 139	23-Apr	Jessica	Female	30s	30 mins.	WhatsApp video call (Rio de Janeiro)	Doctor
Brazilian Interview 140	23-Apr	Alice	Female	30s	1 hour	Google meet (Minas Gerais)	Municipal public servant
Brazilian Interview 141	23-Apr	Samuel José	Male	30s	1 hour	Google meet (Minas Gerais)	Municipal public servant

Brazilian Interview 142	23-Apr	Davi	Male	50s	45 mins.	Google meet (Minas Gerais)	State-level public servant
Brazilian Interview 143	23-Apr	Lilizete	Female	30s	30 mins.	Google meet (Rio de Janeiro)	State-level public servant
Brazilian Interview 144	23-Oct	Antonia Regina	Female	30s	45 mins.	Google meet (Rio de Janeiro)	Municipal public servant
Brazilian Interview 145	23-Oct	Nick	Male	40s	45 mins.	Google meet (Rio de Janeiro)	Migrants' rights activist, NGO employee
Brazilian Interview 146	23-Oct	Tauan	Male	30s	30 mins.	Google meet (Rio de Janeiro)	Immigration lawyer, researcher
Brazilian Interview 147	23-Oct	Mario Ricardo	Male	20s	30 mins.	Google meet (Rio de Janeiro)	Municipal public servant
Brazilian Interview 148	23-Oct	Kilian	Male	50s	30 mins.	Google meet (Rio de Janeiro)	Migrants' rights activist
Brazilian Interview 149	23-Oct	Quentin	Male	30s	30 mins.	Google meet (Rio de Janeiro)	Municipal public servant
Brazilian Interview 150	23-Nov	Arla	Gender non-binary	30s	45 mins.	Google meet (Rio de Janeiro)	Researcher, NGO employee

Appendix 2 – Semi-structured Interviews with Venezuelan Participants								
Field Site 1 - Porto Alegre								
<i>File Name</i>	<i>Date</i>	<i>Pseudonym</i>	<i>Gender</i>	<i>Age approx.</i>	<i>Duration</i>	<i>Format (City)</i>	<i>Current Profession in Brazil</i>	<i>Former Profession in Venezuela</i>
Venezuelan Interview 1	23-Mar	Ana Beatriz	Female	30s	1 hour	Google meet	Factory employee	Insurance salesperson
Venezuelan Interview 2	23-Mar	Gerardo	Male	20s	1.5 hours	Café	Cosmetologist	University student
Venezuelan Interview 3	23-Mar	Kevin	Male	30s	1 hour	Office	Public servant	Business administration
Venezuelan Interview 4	23-Mar	Juan	Male	40s	40 mins.	Park	School teacher	School teacher
Venezuelan Interview 5	23-Apr	Emilio	Male	30s	40 mins.	WhatsApp video call	IT employee	School teacher
Venezuelan Interview 6	23-Apr	Mauricio	Male	60s	45 mins.	Café	Retiree	Lawyer
Venezuelan Interview 7	23-Apr	Brandon	Male	30s	30 mins.	Google meet	IT employee	Engineer
Venezuelan Interview 8	23-Apr	Nerea	Female	30s	1 hour	WhatsApp video call	Factory employee	Housewife
Venezuelan Interview 9	23-Apr	Anahys	Female	20s	30 mins.	WhatsApp video call	Bakery employee	Bakery employee
Venezuelan Interview 10	23-Apr	Yuri	Male	30s	30 mins.	WhatsApp video call	Factory employee	Factory employee
Venezuelan Interview 11	23-Apr	Daniela	Female	20s	30 mins.	WhatsApp video call	Domestic worker, cook	Domestic worker, cook
Venezuelan Interview 12	23-Apr	Natasha	Female	50s	40 mins.	Google meet	Business assistant	Public Servant
Venezuelan Interview 13	22-May	Rafael	Male	30s	30 mins.	Office	NGO employee	School teacher
Venezuelan Interview 14	23-May	Raiza	Female	30s	30 mins.	NGO	Housewife	Housewife, cook
Venezuelan Interview 15	23-May	Estefany	Female	30s	30 mins.	NGO	Housewife	Housewife, cook
Venezuelan Interview 16	23-May	Sofia	Female	20s	30 mins.	WhatsApp video call	Factory employee	University student
Venezuelan Interview 17	23-May	Cristina	Female	40s	30 mins.	WhatsApp video call	Bakery employee	Housewife

Venezuelan Interview 18	23-May	Edgar	Male	50s	30 mins.	WhatsApp video call	Private security guard	Police officer
Venezuelan Interview 19	23-May	Naomi	Female	30s	1 hour	Café	School teacher	School teacher
Venezuelan Interview 20	23-May	Angelica Maria	Female	20s	30 mins.	WhatsApp video call	Custodian	University student
Venezuelan Interview 21	23-May	Lucrecia	Female	30s	30 mins.	WhatsApp video call	Domestic worker	Custodian, fish vendor
Venezuelan Interview 22	23-May	Genesis	Female	20s	20 mins.	WhatsApp video call	Unemployed, Factory employee	Housewife
Venezuelan Interview 23	23-May	Perla	Female	50s	45 mins.	WhatsApp video call	Childcare provider	Public Servant
Venezuelan Interview 24	23-May	Jorge Juan	Male	40s	30 mins.	WhatsApp video call	Factory employee	Business administration
Venezuelan Interview 25	23-May	Gertrudis	Female	30s	45 mins.	WhatsApp video call	House cleaner	House cleaner
Venezuelan Interview 26	23-May	Carolina	Female	20s	30 mins.	WhatsApp video call	Domestic worker	Market vendor
Venezuelan Interview 27	23-May	Leticia	Female	20s	30 mins.	WhatsApp video call	House cleaner	Decorator and seamstress
Venezuelan Interview 28	23-May	Alejandra	Female	40s	1 hour	Google meet	IT employee	Psychologist
Venezuelan Interview 29	23-May	Rigoberta	Female	50s	30 mins.	WhatsApp video call	Unemployed, Cook	School teacher
Venezuelan Interview 30	23-May	Claudio	Male	30s	45 mins.	Google meet	Musician	University student
Venezuelan Interview 31	23-Jun	German	Male	30s	30 mins.	Google meet	Musician	Musician
Venezuelan Interview 32	23-Jun	Alba Maria	Female	50s	1 hour	Google meet	Artist	Artist
Venezuelan Interview 33	23-Nov	Moises	Male	20s	30 mins.	WhatsApp video call	Factory employee	University student, mechanic
<b>Field Site 2 - Brasilia</b>								
<i>File Name</i>	<i>Date</i>	<i>Pseudonym</i>	<i>Gender</i>	<i>Age approx.</i>	<i>Duration</i>	<i>Format (City)</i>	<i>Current Profession in Brazil</i>	<i>Former Profession in Venezuela</i>
Venezuelan Interview 34	23-May	Luis	Male	20s	30 mins.	WhatsApp video call	Graphic artist	Journalist
Venezuelan Interview 35	23-May	Kevin José	Male	30s	30 mins.	WhatsApp video call	Handyman	University student
Venezuelan Interview 36	23-Jun	Marta	Female	30s	1 hour	Google meet	Interpreter	Military officer
<b>Field Site 3 - Boa Vista</b>								
<i>File Name</i>	<i>Date</i>	<i>Pseudonym</i>	<i>Gender</i>	<i>Age approx.</i>	<i>Duration</i>	<i>Format (City)</i>	<i>Current Profession in Brazil</i>	<i>Former Profession in Venezuela</i>
Venezuelan Interview 37	23-May	Camilo	Male	50s	30 mins.	Google meet	NGO employee	Business administration
Venezuelan Interview 38	23-Jun	Aurora	Female	40s	1 hour	Front porch	NGO employee	School teacher
Venezuelan Interview 39	23-Jun	Octavia	Female	60s	1 hour	Front porch	Housewife	Housewife
Venezuelan Interview 40	23-Jun	Pablo	Male	30s	1 hour	Café	IO employee	University student
Venezuelan Interview 41	23-Jun	Joaquina	Female	30s	1.5 hours	Café	NGO employee	Lawyer
Venezuelan Interview 42	23-Jun	Marilyn	Female	30s	30 mins.	WhatsApp video call	Domestic Worker	School teacher
<b>Field Site 4 - Manaus</b>								
<i>File Name</i>	<i>Date</i>	<i>Pseudonym</i>	<i>Gender</i>	<i>Age approx.</i>	<i>Duration</i>	<i>Format (City)</i>	<i>Current Profession in Brazil</i>	<i>Former Profession in Venezuela</i>
Venezuelan Interview 43	23-Jun	Patricio	Male	40s	30 mins.	NGO	Unemployed	Mechanic
Venezuelan Interview 44	23-Jun	Giocomo	Male	20s	30 mins.	NGO	Uber Driver	Taxi driver



Venezuelan Interview 45	23-Jun	Cindy	Female	30s	30 mins.	NGO	Unemployed	Cook
Venezuelan Interview 46	23-Jun	Xavier	Male	20s	30 mins.	NGO	Carpenter	Store Clerk
Venezuelan Interview 47	23-Jun	Ana Clara	Female	30s	30 mins.	NGO	Domestic worker	Hairdresser, Clothes vendor
Venezuelan Interview 48	23-Jun	Wilfredo	Male	20s	30 mins.	NGO	NGO employee	University student
Venezuelan Interview 49	23-Jun	Constantino	Male	30s	30 mins.	NGO	Mechanic	Truck driver
Venezuelan Interview 50	23-Jun	Guillermo	Male	30s	45 mins.	Café	IO employee	NGO employee
Venezuelan Interview 51	23-Jun	Martina	Female	30s	30 mins.	NGO	NGO employee	School teacher
Venezuelan Interview 52	23-Jun	Rodney	Male	20s	30 mins.	NGO	Technical student	University student
Venezuelan Interview 53	23-Jun	Marta Rosa	Female	50s	1 hour	Café	Catering entrepreneur	Journalist
Venezuelan Interview 54	23-Jun	Hannah	Female	20s	45 mins.	NGO	Unemployed, domestic servant	Cashier
Venezuelan Interview 55	23-Jun	Christofer	Male	50s	30 mins.	NGO	Custodian	Factory employee
Venezuelan Interview 56	23-Jun	Paula Cristina	Female	30s	30 mins.	NGO	IO and NGO employee	Lawyer, Business Administration
Venezuelan Interview 57	23-Jun	Cassandra	Female	30s	30 mins.	NGO	Custodian Manicurist	Manicurist
Venezuelan Interview 58	23-Jun	Mireyda	Female	60s	30 mins.	NGO	Seamstress	Modist, School teacher
Venezuelan Interview 59	23-Jun	Claudio José	Male	50s	30 mins.	NGO	NGO employee	School teacher
Venezuelan Interview 60	23-Jun	Lauriano	Male	60s	1 hour	NGO	Retired, truck driver	Truck driver
Venezuelan Interview 61	23-Jun	Cleotilde	Female	40s	30 mins.	NGO	Unemployed, housewife	Market vendor
Venezuelan Interview 62	23-Jun	Katia	Female	20s	45 mins.	NGO	Restaurant server	University student
Venezuelan Interview 63	23-Jul	Julia Esther	Female	40s	45 mins.	NGO	Catering entrepreneur	Catering entrepreneur
Venezuelan Interview 64	23-Jul	Reinier	Male	50s	30 mins.	NGO	Unemployed	Oil industry employee
Venezuelan Interview 65	23-Jul	Juan Pablo	Male	40s	45 mins.	NGO	Electrician	Electrician
Venezuelan Interview 66	23-Jul	Yaritza	Female	30s	30 mins.	NGO	Domestic worker	Teacher's aid
Venezuelan Interview 67	23-Jul	Hortencia	Female	50s	30 mins.	NGO	Unemployed	Housewife, schoolteacher
Venezuelan Interview 68	23-Jul	Andrea	Female	30s	45 mins.	NGO	NGO employee	Lawyer
Venezuelan Interview 69	23-Jul	Mikaela	Female	20s	30 mins.	NGO	Beautician	Nurse
Venezuelan Interview 70	23-Jul	Lucia	Female	20s	30 mins.	NGO	Street vender	University student
Venezuelan Interview 71	23-Jul	Esther	Female	50s	30 mins.	NGO	Street vender, seamstress	Nurse
Venezuelan Interview 72	23-Jul	Georgina	Female	20s	30 mins.	NGO	NGO employee	University student
Venezuelan Interview 73	23-Jul	Ana Patricia	Female	20s	30 mins.	NGO	Restaurant server	Restaurant owner
Venezuelan Interview 74	23-Jul	Eliezer	Male	50s	45 mins.	NGO	Street vender	Oil industry employee
Venezuelan Interview 75	23-Jul	Sebastian	Male	20s	30 mins.	NGO	Unemployed	University student, musician
Venezuelan Interview 76	23-Jul	Cleopatra	Female	30s	30 mins.	NGO	Unemployed	Dance instructor, Beautician
Venezuelan Interview 77	23-Jul	Maria Andrea	Female	20s	30 mins.	NGO	NGO employee	Doctor
Venezuelan Interview 78	23-Jul	Sergio	Male	20s	45 mins.	NGO	NGO employee	Psychologist

Venezuelan Interview 79	23-Jul	Silvania	Female	30s	1 hour	Café	Domestic worker, Street vender	Public accountant
Venezuelan Interview 80	23-Jul	Paulo Marcelo	Male	40s	30 mins.	NGO	Unemployed, dockworker	Factory employee
Venezuelan Interview 81	23-Jul	Deborah	Female	20s	30 mins.	NGO	Custodian	Secretary
Venezuelan Interview 82	23-Jul	Max	Male	20s	30 mins.	NGO	Unemployed, student	University student
Venezuelan Interview 83	23-Jul	Cupertina	Female	60s	30 mins.	NGO	Unemployed	Cook, vendor
Venezuelan Interview 84	23-Jul	Prudencia	Female	50s	30 mins.	NGO	Nanny, Maid	Business Administration
Venezuelan Interview 85	23-Jul	Serena	Female	20s	30 mins.	NGO	Student, Maid	Farmer
Venezuelan Interview 86	23-Jul	Marta Sofia	Female	20s	30 mins.	NGO	Student	Student
Venezuelan Interview 87	23-Jul	Crystal	Female	30s	30 mins.	NGO	Unemployed	Cook
Venezuelan Interview 88	23-Jul	Jairo	Male	20s	45 mins.	NGO	Factory Logistics Intern	University student
Venezuelan Interview 89	23-Jul	Denis	Male	20s	30 mins.	NGO	Street vender	University student
Venezuelan Interview 90	23-Jul	Carlos Alberto	Male	20s	30 mins.	NGO	Security guard	Clothes vendor
Venezuelan Interview 91	23-Jul	Marcelino	Male	20s	30 mins.	NGO	Handyman	Computer repair
Venezuelan Interview 92	23-Jul	Francisco	Male	20s	1 hour	Café	IO employee	Hotel employee
Venezuelan Interview 93	23-Jul	Digna Rosa	Female	60s	1 hour	Café	NGO employee	University professor
Venezuelan Interview 94	23-Jul	Robertico	Male	20s	30 mins.	NGO	NGO employee	University student
Venezuelan Interview 95	23-Sep	Jeremias	Male	20s	30 mins.	Google meet	Researcher	University student
<b>Field Site 5 - São Paulo</b>								
<i>File Name</i>	<i>Date</i>	<i>Pseudonym</i>	<i>Gender</i>	<i>Age approx.</i>	<i>Duration</i>	<i>Format (City)</i>	<i>Current Profession in Brazil</i>	<i>Former Profession in Venezuela</i>
Venezuelan Interview 96	23-Jun	Marcos	Male	30s	45 mins.	Google meet	IT employee	Engineer
Venezuelan Interview 97	23-Sep	Margarita	Female	50s	30 mins.	WhatsApp video call	Seamstress	Tourism agent
Venezuelan Interview 98	23-Sep	Rubiseida Juana	Female	40s	45 mins.	WhatsApp video call	NGO employee	Housewife/ Lawyer
Venezuelan Interview 99	23-Sep	Teresita	Female	40s	30 mins.	WhatsApp video call	Custodian	Storeowner
Venezuelan Interview 100	23-Sep	Pamella	Female	20s	30 mins.	WhatsApp video call	Housewife	Student
Venezuelan Interview 101	23-Sep	Antonia Maria	Female	30s	30 mins.	WhatsApp video call	Housewife	Vendor
Venezuelan Interview 102	23-Sep	Pancho	Male	20s	1 hour	Google meet	Human resources employee	Lawyer/Public servant
Venezuelan Interview 103	23-Oct	Zayma	Female	40s	45 mins.	WhatsApp video call	Domestic worker	Lawyer
Venezuelan Interview 104	23-Oct	Barbarita	Female	30s	30 mins.	WhatsApp video call	Domestic worker	School teacher
Venezuelan Interview 105	23-Oct	Concepcion	Female	50s	30 mins.	NGO	Caretaker for the elderly	Custodian
Venezuelan Interview 106	23-Oct	Alma	Female	40s	30 mins.	NGO	Domestic worker	Farmer
Venezuelan Interview 107	23-Oct	Xiomena	Female	20s	30 mins.	NGO	Unemployed, Housewife	Cook
Venezuelan Interview 108	23-Oct	Maria del Carmen	Female	40s	30 mins.	NGO	Custodian	Cook
Venezuelan Interview 109	23-Oct	Darcy	Female	20s	30 mins.	NGO	Student, Shopkeeper	Student

Venezuelan Interview 110	23-Oct	Marietta	Female	30s	30 mins.	WhatsApp video call	Security guard	School teacher
Venezuelan Interview 111	23-Oct	Carlos Manuel	Male	30s	30 mins.	WhatsApp video call	Telemarketing	Laboratory technician
Venezuelan Interview 112	23-Oct	Mario	Male	30s	30 mins.	WhatsApp video call	Construction worker	Construction worker
Venezuelan Interview 113	23-Oct	Antonietta Esther	Female	30s	30 mins.	WhatsApp video call	Cook	Cook
Venezuelan Interview 114	23-Oct	Plutarco	Male	40s	30 mins.	WhatsApp video call	Custodian	Mechanic, small business
Venezuelan Interview 115	23-Oct	Mario Alberto	Male	30s	1 hour	WhatsApp video call	Bicycle mechanic	Police officer
Venezuelan Interview 116	23-Oct	Atenor	Male	40s	30 mins.	WhatsApp video call	Unemployed	Cook, business owner
Venezuelan Interview 117	23-Oct	Betty	Female	50s	30 mins.	WhatsApp video call	Cook	Social worker, schoolteacher
Venezuelan Interview 118	23-Oct	Laura Patricia	Female	50s	30 mins.	WhatsApp video call	Restaurant manager	Business administration
Venezuelan Interview 119	23-Nov	Angelo	Male	30s	30 mins.	Workshop	Mason	Bank teller/ security guard
Venezuelan Interview 120	23-Nov	Paulo Ramon	Male	30s	30 mins.	Workshop	Mason	Carpenter/ Handyman
Venezuelan Interview 121	23-Dec	Wandel	Male	40s	30 mins.	WhatsApp video call	NGO employee	Accountant
Venezuelan Interview 122	23-Dec	Antonia	Female	30s	30 mins.	WhatsApp video call	Entrepreneur	Airport security agent
Venezuelan Interview 123	23-Dec	Zeferino	Male	40s	30 mins.	WhatsApp video call	Security guard	Police officer
Venezuelan Interview 124	23-Dec	Laura	Female	40s	30 mins.	WhatsApp video call	Factory employee	Oil company employee
Venezuelan Interview 125	23-Dec	Renner	Male	20s	30 mins.	WhatsApp video call	Customer service agent	University student
Venezuelan Interview 126	24-Jan	Cintia	Female	30s	30 mins.	Office	NGO employee	Cook
<b>Field Site 6 - Miscellaneous</b>								
<i>File Name</i>	<i>Date</i>	<i>Pseudonym</i>	<i>Gender</i>	<i>Age approx.</i>	<i>Duration</i>	<i>Format (State)</i>	<i>Current Profession in Brazil</i>	<i>Former Profession in Venezuela</i>
Venezuelan Interview 127	23-Apr	Esperanza	Female	30s	30 mins.	WhatsApp video call (Rio de Janeiro)	Housewife, cook	Lawyer
Venezuelan Interview 128	23-May	Valeria	Female	40s	30 mins.	WhatsApp video call (Rio de Janeiro)	Spanish teacher	Public Servant
Venezuelan Interview 129	23-May	Beatriz Jimena	Female	50s	30 mins.	WhatsApp video call (Rio de Janeiro)	Caterer	Internet café owner
Venezuelan Interview 130	23-May	Jorge	Male	30s	45 mins.	Google meet (Rio de Janeiro)	NGO employee	University Student
Venezuelan Interview 131	23-May	Nancy	Female	40s	45 mins.	Google meet (Rio de Janeiro)	NGO volunteer	Small business owner
Venezuelan Interview 132	23-May	Ana Sofia	Female	30s	30 mins.	WhatsApp video call (Rio de Janeiro)	Telemarketing	University student
Venezuelan Interview 133	23-Oct	Teresa	Female	50s	1 hour	WhatsApp video call (Rio de Janeiro)	NGO employee	School teacher
Venezuelan Interview 134	23-Oct	Laura Maria	Trans woman	40s	30 mins.	WhatsApp video call (Santa Catarina)	Hairdresser/ Factory employee	Hairdresser
Venezuelan Interview 135	23-Oct	Alba	Female	20s	30 mins.	WhatsApp video call (Santa Catarina)	Restaurant employee	University student

Venezuelan Interview 136	23-Oct	Jorge Rafael	Male	20s	30 mins.	WhatsApp video call (Santa Catarina)	Painter	University student
Venezuelan Interview 137	23-Nov	Magno	Male	30s	45 mins.	WhatsApp video call (Santa Catarina)	DJ/ Event promoter	DJ/ Music producer
Venezuelan Interview 138	23-Dec	Gabriel Tomas	Male	30s	30 mins.	WhatsApp video call (Santa Catarina)	Factory employee	Engineer
Venezuelan Interview 139	23-Dec	Bryant	Trans man	30s	30 mins.	WhatsApp video call (Rio de Janeiro)	NGO employee/ Maid	Police officer
Venezuelan Interview 140	23-Dec	Niurka	Female	40s	30 mins.	Google meet (Minas Gerais)	Spanish teacher/university student	University professor

Appendix 3 – Participant Observations					
Field Site 1 - Porto Alegre					
<i>File Name</i>	<i>Event Description</i>	<i>Date</i>	<i>Duration</i>	<i>Type of Location</i>	<i>Summary of Observations</i>
Participant Observation 1	Lecture	23-Mar	2 hours	University	University lecture on bilingual and translingual education for migrants and other linguistically marginalized communities in Brazil
Participant Observation 2	Public meeting	23-Mar	1 hour	Municipal building	Meeting about social welfare assistance programs for migrants and refugees.
Participant Observation 3	Migrant/refugee assistance center	23-Mar	2 hours	Migrant/refugee assistance center	Toured and met with employees of migrant assistance center.
Participant Observation 4	Social services office	23-Apr	1 hour	Government social services office	Visited government social services office and met with social workers and psychologists that provide information and services for Venezuelan migrants.
Participant Observation 5	Federal Police office	23-Apr	1 hour	Federal government building	Visited federal government building due to personal need to register as foreigner living temporarily in Brazil and observed interactions between other foreigners and Brazilian workers.
Participant Observation 6	Nearby town that hosts 100s of Venezuelan migrants	23-Apr	2 hours	Municipal buildings and public spaces	Visited municipal buildings (town hall, city council building, public health clinic) and public spaces (parks, squares, shops) of nearby town that hosts 100s of Venezuelan migrants to gauge level of inclusion.
Participant Observation 7	Nearby town that hosts 100s of Venezuelan migrants	23-Apr	1 hour	Municipal buildings and public spaces	Visited municipal buildings (town hall, city council building, public health clinic) and public spaces (parks, squares, shops) of nearby town that hosts 100s of Venezuelan migrants to gauge level of inclusion.
Participant Observation 8	Municipal office	23-Apr	1.5 hours	Municipal building	Given tour of refugee reception and social assistance office of a local town and all of the offices there that provide services to refugees and talked with local public servants and social workers.
Participant Observation 9	Municipal Health Clinic (SUS)	23-Apr	1.5 hours	Municipal building	Visited local SUS clinic for personal health visit and experienced the system as a user.
Participant Observation 10	Social services office	23-May	1 hour	Municipal building	Visited government social services office and met with social workers that provide information and services for Venezuelan migrants.
Participant Observation 11	Social services office	23-May	1.5 hours	Municipal building	Visited government social services office and met with social workers that provide information and services for Venezuelan migrants.

Participant Observation 12	NGO for migrants/refugees	23-May	1 hour	Office	Visited NGO that provides services for Venezuelan migrants.
Participant Observation 13	Conference	23-May	1 hour	Virtual	Conference on migrant's healthcare and health issues.
Participant Observation 14	Church	23-May	1 hour	Church	Visit to local church that has a program to aid Venezuelan migrants.
Participant Observation 15	Public arts event	23-May	3 hours	Public square	Attended public arts event with live music and presence of migrants and refugees.
Participant Observation 16	Municipal Health Clinic (SUS)	23-May	2 hours	Municipal building	Visited local SUS clinic for personal health visit and experienced the system as a user.
Participant Observation 17	Religious service	23-May	2 hours	Virtual	Watched the live stream of a religious worship service in Spanish for Venezuelan migrants.
<b>Field Site 2 - Brasilia</b>					
<i>File Name</i>	<i>Event Description</i>	<i>Date</i>	<i>Duration</i>	<i>Type of Location</i>	<i>Summary of Observations</i>
Participant Observation 18	NGO for migrants/refugees	23-May	1.5 hours	Office	Visited NGO that provides services for Venezuelan migrants and spoke with staff and migrants.
Participant Observation 19	Politician office	23-May	2 hours	Office	Spent time observing lobbying efforts and interactions among staff of federal politician and local interest groups.
Participant Observation 20	Museum	23-May	1 hour	Museum	Walked through the collection of a museum focused on labor, personal labor talents, entrepreneurship, and innovation in Brazil.
Participant Observation 21	Politician office	23-May	1 hour	Office	Spent time observing lobbying efforts and interactions among staff of federal politician and local interest groups.
Participant Observation 22	Public market	23-May	1.5 hours	Public market	Attended public market to see vendor and client relations.
Participant Observation 23	Church	23-May	1 hour	Church	Visited a local church that has a program to aid Venezuelan migrants with food, housing, employment, and healthcare.
Participant Observation 24	Public arts event	23-May	2 hours	Art fair	Visited local arts fair that featured artists from Brasilia and nearby states, both migrants and non-migrants.
Participant Observation 25	Federal building	23-May	2 hours	Federal government building	Went to federal building to see how migration governance is conducted by observing interactions between migration policy leaders and civil society organizations.
<b>Field Site 3 - Boa Vista</b>					
<i>File Name</i>	<i>Event Description</i>	<i>Date</i>	<i>Duration</i>	<i>Type of Location</i>	<i>Summary of Observations</i>
Participant Observation 26	Public square	23-Jun	3 hours	Public square	Walked around main downtown areas, public squares, and riverfront to see presence of Venezuelan migrants in the city.
Participant Observation 27	Federal university	23-Jun	3 hours	University	Met with various researchers that are researching about Venezuelan migration and toured university buildings, as well as neighborhoods with large concentrations of migrants.

Participant Observation 28	Downtown commercial center	23-Jun	1 hour	Commercial market district	Visited neighborhood focused on local commerce to observe differences between Brazilian and migrant owned businesses, their structure, their products, and their interactions with each other and customers.
Participant Observation 29	Venezuelan migrant's land occupation	23-Jun	2 hours	Informal housing	Invited to visit a land occupation led by Venezuelan migrants on outskirts of town and speak with the local residents to see how they build their homes, acquire income, and resist government and local pressure to leave this plot of land.
Participant Observation 30	Shopping mall	23-Jun	2 hours	Shopping mall	Walked around the town's main shopping mall to gauge presence of migrants and see how migrants and Brazilian nationals interact with each other.
Participant Observation 31	NGO for migrants/refugees	23-Jun	1 hour	Office	Visited NGO that provides services for Venezuelan migrants.
Participant Observation 32	Venezuelan restaurant	23-Jun	4 hours	Restaurant	Ate at Venezuelan owned and themed restaurant on several occasions and spoke with the owners and employees.
Participant Observation 33	Church	23-Jun	2 hours	Church and social services center	Toured a church/civil society complex that offers meals, soup kitchen, laundry services, bathroom and showers, services for women and children, and a school for Venezuelans.
Participant Observation 34	Airport	23-Jun	4 hours	Airport	Witnessed the <i>interiorização</i> process firsthand as military officers help Venezuelans find their flights to be resettled to other parts of Brazil, many of these seemed like emotional good byes between people who knew each other rather well.
Participant Observation 35	Refugee housing center	23-Jun	1 hour	Refugee housing Center	Visited local housing center for Venezuelan migrants/refugees that are in the process of being resettled from Roraima to other states further in-land in Brazil to see the complex and hear about the daily activities, and projects available for them there.
Participant Observation 36	NGO for migrants/refugees	23-Jun	1 hour	Office	Visited NGO that provides services for Venezuelan migrants.
<b>Field Site 4 - Manaus</b>					
<i>File Name</i>	<i>Event Description</i>	<i>Date</i>	<i>Duration</i>	<i>Type of Location</i>	<i>Summary of Observations</i>
Participant Observation 37	Bar/restaurant	23-Jun	3 hours	Bar/Restaurant	Visited and spent time at an outside bar/restaurant where all of the wait staff are Venezuelan migrants.
Participant Observation 38	NGO for migrants/refugees	23-Jun	2 hours	Office	Visited NGO that provides services for Venezuelan migrants.
Participant Observation 39	Lecture	23-Jun	3 hours	University	Attended public lecture and discussion that included researchers, Venezuelan migrants, NGO employees, and civil society members on migrants' rights and policy issues in the Amazon.
Participant Observation 40	<i>Festa Junina</i> (June Party)	23-Jun	2 hours	Public Square	Walked around main downtown areas, public squares, and opera house to see presence of Venezuelan migrants in the city.
Participant Observation 41	NGO for migrants/refugees	23-Jun	5 hours a day for 15 days	Office	Visited NGO that provides services for Venezuelan migrants, and talked extensively with staff that is half Brazilians and half Venezuelans and witnessed them providing various services and assistance to 100s of Venezuelan migrants.
Participant Observation 42	Soup kitchen	23-Jun	5 hours	Soup kitchen	Volunteered at a soup kitchen that produces meals for Venezuelans and Brazilians in financial need.
Participant Observation 43	Local Sunday market	23-Jul	2 hours	Public Market	Attended public market to see vendor and client relations between migrants and non-migrants.

Participant Observation 44	Training session for Venezuelan NGO volunteers	23-Jul	2 hours	NGO office	Attended training session for future volunteers at an NGO that focused on ethical standards when volunteering with migrants and refugees.
Participant Observation 45	Venezuelan restaurant	23-Aug	2 hours	Restaurant	Ate at Venezuelan owned and operated restaurant.
Participant Observation 46	Social services office	23-Aug	2 hours	Government social services office	Visited government social services office and met with public servants that provide services for Venezuelan refugees and other vulnerable populations.
Participant Observation 47	Venezuelan restaurant	23-Aug	2 hours	Restaurant	Ate at Venezuelan owned and themed restaurant and spoke with the owners and employees.
Participant Observation 48	Public market	23-Aug	3 hours	Public market	Attended public market to see vendor and client relations between migrants and non-migrants.
Participant Observation 49	Venezuelan barber shop	23-Aug	3 hours	Barber shop	Went for haircuts on three occasions to barber shop where all the employees are Venezuelan migrants and spoke extensively with them about living and work conditions in Brazil and Venezuela, politics in both countries, and what being a migrant in Brazil is like.
<b>Field Site 5 - São Paulo</b>					
<i>File Name</i>	<i>Event Description</i>	<i>Date</i>	<i>Duration</i>	<i>Type of Location</i>	<i>Summary of Observations</i>
Participant Observation 50	Art festival	23-Sep	2 hours	Museum	Art festival that featured many pieces specifically about refugees and migrants in Brazil and throughout the world.
Participant Observation 51	Commercial district	23-Sep	3 hours	Businesses	Checked out commercial district with many businesses owned or operated by migrants and refugees in downtown São Paulo.
Participant Observation 52	Refugee shelter	23-Sep	2 hours	Housing center	Toured a refugee shelter that housed numerous Venezuelan refugees until 2020 and currently host Afghan and other refugee groups, and spoke with the Brazilian employees of the shelter.
Participant Observation 53	Main avenues and parks	23-Oct	3 hours	Public spaces	Walked around city's main thoroughfares and parks to gauge presence of Venezuelan migrants, if they were engaged in commerce, street begging, or other activities, and locals' response to their presence.
Participant Observation 54	Refugee shelter	23-Oct	2 hours	Housing center	Visited a refugee shelter for Venezuelan refugees and got to see how their social integration in São Paulo works, spoke with them extensively, and shared a meal of arepas and coffee with them.
Participant Observation 55	Refugee shelter and reception center	23-Nov	1.5 hours	Housing center	Visited a religious institution that also has a housing shelter for refugees and offers a wide variety of services for refugees and migrants such as: documental assistance, Portuguese classes, basic healthcare services, etc.
Participant Observation 56	Government services office	23-Nov	1 hour	Municipal building	Visit to government services office that helps residents in São Paulo access paperwork, get documents and IDs, and provides other services.
Participant Observation 57	Land occupation	23-Nov	2 hours	Informal housing	Attended public event at an informal housing occupation in downtown São Paulo that featured local artists, food, and music, as well as political speeches regarding housing policy and justice and marginalized populations in the city.
Participant Observation 58	Migrant/refugee assistance center	23-Nov	1 hour	Municipal building	Toured and met with employees of migrant/refugee assistance center.
Participant Observation 59	28th annual Immigrants' Fest	23-Nov	3 hours	Museum and public park	Went to the 28th annual Immigrants' Fest which featured cultural presentations, folkloric dances, artists, and food from various immigrant groups in São Paulo, among them, Venezuelans, Syrians, Afghans, Congolese, Italians, etc.
Participant Observation 60	Immigration Museum	23-Dec	2 hours	Museum and public park	Visited local immigration museum in São Paulo that retells stories of past periods of immigration to the state and Brazil.